COURT OF APPEAL OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

SECOND APPELLATE DISTRICT



THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA,)
PLAINTIFF-RESPONDENT,)) SUPERIOR COURT
V5.) NO. A-090435
JOE HUNT, AKA JOSEPH HUNT, AKA JOSEPH HENRY GAMSKY,)
DEFENDANT-APPELLANT.) OCT 0 9 1987

APPEAL FROM THE SUPERIOR COURT OF LOS ANGELES COUNTY HONORABLE LAURENCE J. RITTENBAND, JUDGE PRESIDING **REPORTERS' TRANSCRIPT ON APPEAL**

APPEARANCES:

JOHN K. VAN DE KAMP FOR PLAINTIFF-RESPONDENT: STATE ATTORNEY GENERAL 3580 WILSHIRE BOULEVARD ROOM 800 LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90010

FOR DEFENDANT-APPELLANT:

IN PROPRIA PERSONA

VOLUME 77 OF 101 (PAGES 12353 TO 2336 , INCLUSIVE)



ROSEMARIE GOODBODY, CSR NO. 932 SALLY YERGER, CSR NO. 2008 OFFICIAL REPORTERS

SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

FOR THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

DEPARTMENT WEST C HON. LAURENCE J. RITTENBAND, JUDGE

THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA,

PLAINTIFF,

)

))

VS.

NO. A-090435

JOSEPH HUNT,

DEFENDANT.

REPORTERS' DAILY TRANSCRIPT MONDAY, APRIL 6, 1987

VOLUME 77

PAGES 12253 TO 12336, INCL.

APPEARANCES:

ļ

4.4

FOR THE PLAINTIFF: IRA REINER, DISTRICT ATTORNEY BY: FREDERICK N. WAPNER, DEPUTY 1725 MAIN STREET SANTA MONICA, CALIFORNIA 90401

FOR THE DEFENDANT: ARTHUR H. BARENS, ESQ. 10209 SANTA MONICA BOULEVARD LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90067

AND

RICHARD C. CHIER, ESQ. 10920 WILSHIRE BOULEVARD LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90024

> ROSEMARIE GOODBODY, CSR NO. 932 SALLY YERGER, CSR NO. 2008 OFFICIAL REPORTERS

		÷																									
 28	27	26	25	24	23	22	21	20	19	18	17	16	15	14	13	12	1	10	9	ω	7	თ	ഗ	4	ω	N	-
												240	PEOPLE'S							LOPEZ,	DEFENDANT'S	, <u>, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , </u>					MONDAY,
												COMPOS I TE	i						(CUNIINUĘU) (FURTHFR)								APRIL
												TE DRAWING	EXHIBITS:							JESUS ADELBERTO	WITNESSE		CHRON				<u> 6, 1987</u>
												ING			EXHIBITS			 		TO	ES:		CHRONOLOG I CAL				37
															FOR						DIRECT		INDEX		P.M.	A.M.	VOLUME
													ID		VOLUME 77				122		CROS		OF				JME 77
												12270	FOR DENTIFICAT	ļ	7			t 1 1 1	3		SS		WITNESSES				
												70	ICATION						12289		REDIRECT		S				PAGES 122
												12273	IN EVIDENCE					01C71	s N		RECROS				1231	1225	53 1233

- ----

SANTA MONICA, CALIFORNIA; MONDAY, APRIL 6, 1987; 10:35 A.M. 1 2 DEPARTMENT WEST C HON. LAURENCE J. RITTENBAND, JUDGE 3 (APPEARANCES AS NOTED ON TITLE PAGE 4 EXCEPT MR. CHIER IS NOT PRESENT.) 5 6 THE COURT: GOOD MORNING, LADIES AND GENTLEMEN. 7 8 JESUS ADELBERTO LOPEZ, 9 THE WITNESS ON THE STAND AT THE TIME OF ADJOURNMENT, RESUMED 10 THE STAND AND TESTIFIED FURTHER AS FOLLOWS: 11 THE CLERK: YOU HAVE BEEN PREVIOUSLY SWORN SO YOU ARE 12 STILL UNDER OATH. 13 IF YOU WOULD JUST STATE YOUR NAME AGAIN FOR THE 14 RECORD. 15 THE WITNESS: IT IS JESUS ADELBERTO LOPEZ. 16 17 CROSS-EXAMINATION (RESUMED) 18 BY MR. WAPNER: 19 Q MR. LOPEZ, DID YOU EVER SEE THIS MAN WITH THE 20 SILVER HAIR PUMPING THE GAS IN THE CAR? 21 NO, I DIDN'T. А 22 AND WHEN YOU FIRST SAW HIM, HE WAS ALREADY AT Q 23 THE CASHIER? 24 A YES, SIR. 25 WHEN YOU DROVE INTO THE STATION, YOU PULLED UP Q 26 NEXT TO THE PUMP, CORRECT? 27 А RIGHT. 28 Q AND AFTER YOU PULLED UP NEXT TO THE PUMP, DID

وريا

1	YOU IMMEDIATELY GET OUT AND START PUMPING THE GAS?
2	A YES.
3	Q WHEN YOU GOT OUT AND PUMPED THE GAS, YOU DIDN'T
4	HAVE TO WAIT FOR THE PUMP, RIGHT, BECAUSE THERE WASN'T ANY
5	OTHER CARS IN THE STATION?
6	A RIGHT.
7	Q SO YOU JUST HAD TO GET OUT, WALK TO THE REAR
8	OF THE CAR ON THE DRIVER'S SIDE, RIGHT?
9	A YES.
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

Q 1 THAT IS WHERE THE GAS TANK IS LOCATED ON THE 2 PRELUDE? 3 А YES IT IS. 4 THEN YOU OPEN THE DOOR FOR THE GAS TANK AND YOU Q 5 UNSCREW THE TOP, RIGHT? 6 А RIGHT. 7 Q AND THEN YOU PUT THE PUMP IN? 8 А YES. 9 AND THEN AFTER YOU DID THAT, WHEN WAS IT THAT YOU Q 10 NOTICED THIS MAN AT THE CASHIER PAYING? 11 А WHEN I TURNED AROUND. 12 DO YOU HAVE ANY ESTIMATE OF HOW LONG YOU HAD 0 13 BEEN PUMPING GAS OR HOW MANY GALLONS YOU HAD PUT IN OR HOW 14 MUCH TIME HAD PASSED BEFORE YOUR TURNED AROUND AND SAW THE 15 PERSON --16 А NO. I HAVE NO ESTIMATE ON THAT. 17 Q WHEN YOU FIRST PUT THE PUMP INTO THE TANK, YOU 18 HAVE TO -- I ASSUME YOU LOOKED WHAT YOU WERE DOING? 19 A YES. 20 0 WOULD IT BE FAIR TO SAY THAT AT THAT POINT, YOU 21 WERE AT LEAST LOOKING TOWARD THE EAST ON THIS DIAGRAM? 22 А YES. 23 Q AND DO YOU HAVE ANY IDEA HOW LONG YOU CONTINUED 24 TO LOOK IN THAT DIRECTION? 25 А NOT REALLY. 26 Q REGARDING THIS ESTIMATE THAT YOU MADE THAT YOU 27 WERE IN THE GAS STATION FOR 20 MINUTES, WOULD YOU SAY THAT 28 YOU ARE NOT VERY GOOD AT ESTIMATING TIME?

1	A YES, BASICALLY.
2	Q YES, BUT YOU ARE NOT GOOD?
3	A YES. I AM NOT VERY GOOD.
4	Q OKAY. WHEN YOU WERE IN THE STATION WELL, DID
5	YOU SEE THIS PERSON WITH THE SILVER HAIR GO FROM THE CASHIER
6	TO HIS CAR?
7	MR. BARENS: ASKED AND ANSWERED.
8	THE COURT: SUSTAINED.
9	Q BY MR. WAPNER: DID YOU SEE HIM WHEN YOU WERE
10	INTERVIEWED ON THE 22ND OF NOVEMBER DID YOU MAKE ANY
11	MENTION OF THE FACT THAT WHEN THE PERSON FINISHED PAYING, THAT
12	HE STOPPED AT THE COKE MACHINE?
13	A YES. I BELIEVE I DID.
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

DID YOU HAVE A CHANCE TO REVIEW THE TRANSCRIPT? 1 Q 2 А YES. 3 DID YOU FIND IT THERE WHERE IT WAS YOU SAID THAT Q 4 HE STOPPED AT THE COKE MACHINE? NO, I DON'T THINK I DID. I AM NOT SURE. 5 А WHY DO YOU THINK IT IS IN THERE IF YOU SAID IT? 6 Q BECAUSE WE ALL -- WE ALSO WERE INTERVIEWED 7 А 8 TOGETHER OUTSIDE OF THAT. YOU THINK IT WAS WHEN YOU WERE TALKING OUTSIDE 9 Q 10 THE ROOM? A I WAS TALKING -- IT WAS WHEN, I BELIEVE, I WAS 11 TALKING TO MACMAC, I AM NOT SURE, AND YOU WERE THERE AND --12 13 BECAUSE I BELIEVE I MENTIONED THAT HE WAS DRINKING A COKE, HIS FRIEND WAS DRINKING A COKE, THAT IS WHEN I SAW THEM 14 15 TOGETHER. DO YOU REMEMBER SAYING THIS DURING THE INTERVIEW 16 0 OF NOVEMBER THE 22ND, THE STATEMENT, PART OF WHICH IS 17 UNINTELLIGIBLE, AND IT SAYS: "THIS WAY, SEE, BECAUSE I --18 19 PAYING ATTENTION TO HIM. HE WAS THERE AND THEN, YOU KNOW, 20 I WAS PUMPING GAS AND I GUESS WHEN HE FINISHED PAYING, HE 21 WENT TO HIS CAR AND THAT IS WHEN I PUT MY STUFF AWAY AND 22 WENT TO PAY." 23 DO YOU REMEMBER SAYING THAT? 24 NOT REALLY. А 25 IT HAS BEEN A WHILE. 26 Q IF I SHOW THIS TO YOU --27 IS THAT WHAT I SAID? А 28 WOULD IT REFRESH YOUR RECOLLECTION THAT YOU MADE Q

12257

- 1

1	THAT STATEMENT?
2	A YEAH, I DID.
3	Q WOULD IT BE FAIR TO SAY THAT?
4	MR. BARENS: OBJECTION. WHAT IS FAIR TO SAY IS
5	IRRELEVANT.
6	THE COURT: SUSTAINED.
7	Q BY MR. WAPNER: WERE YOU PAYING PARTICULAR
8	ATTENTION TO THIS PERSON WITH THE SILVER HAIR?
9	A YES, I WAS.
10	Q WHY?
11	A BECAUSE HE STOOD OUT, ESPECIALLY IN THAT AREA,
12	HE REALLY STOOD OUT.
13	Q DID YOU SPEND TIME CHECKING HIM OUT?
14	A YES.
15	Q DO YOU REMEMBER SAYING THIS ON NOVEMBER THE 22ND:
16	"NO, I I JUST NO, I JUST DIDN'T
17	LOOK AT HIM THAT GOOD. I MEAN, YOU KNOW, IT IS
18	KIND OF LIKE AFTER SHE TOLD ME, IT WAS KIND OF
19	LIKE, YOU KNOW, I SAW A GUY BUT I WASN'T REALLY
20	TRYING TO CHECK THE GUY OUT."
21	DO YOU REMEMBER SAYING THAT ON NOVEMBER 22ND?
22	A YES.
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

٠...

1	Q WASN'T IT ONLY AFTER YOU GOT BACK TO THE CAR AND
2	YOU TALKED TO CARMEN ABOUT THIS PERSON, THAT YOU REALLY
3	STARTED THINKING ABOUT HIM?
4	MR. BARENS: OBJECTION, ARGUMENTATIVE.
5	THE COURT: OVERRULED.
6	THE WITNESS: NO. BECAUSE HE REALLY STOOD OUT IN THAT
7	PLACE. SO I HAD NOTICED HIM WAY BEFORE SHE TALKED TO ME.
8	Q BY MR. WAPNER: WAS THERE SOMETHING UNUSUAL ABOUT
9	THE FACT THAT THERE WAS A GOOD-LOOKING MAN AT THAT GAS STATION?
10	A YES.
11	Q WHAT?
12	A THAT HE WAS AN OLDER, GOOD-LOOKING MAN. THAT FACT
13	ITSELF, IS IT IS THE UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA SO MOSTLY
14	COLLEGE STUDENTS HANG OUT IN THAT AREA.
15	Q IS THAT THE ONLY OLDER PERSON YOU HAVE EVER SEEN
16	IN THAT GAS STATION?
17	A IT IS THE ONLY ONE I REMEMBER.
18	Q HOW OFTEN HAVE YOU BEEN TO THAT PARTICULAR STATION?
19	A ABOUT THREE OR FOUR TIMES.
20	Q THAT IS THE ONLY "OLDER PERSON" THAT YOU EVER
21	REMEMBER SEEING AT THAT GAS STATION?
22	A YES.
23	Q ARE THERE RESIDENCES IN THE AREA OF THE GAS
24	STATION?
25	A YEAH. I BELIEVE SO.
26	Q IS THAT STUDENT HOUSING OR IS IT ALL KINDS OF PEOPLE
27	THAT LIVE AROUND THERE?
28	A ALL KINDS OF PEOPLE.

×...×

1 OLDER PEOPLE, YOUNGER PEOPLE, MIDDLE-AGED PEOPLE? 0 2 А YEAH. 3 HAVE YOU EVER MADE A MISTAKE IN IDENTIFYING 0 SOMEONE THAT -- THAT IS, THAT YOU SEE SOMEBODY ON THE STREET 4 THAT YOU THOUGHT WAS SOMEBODY ELSE AND YOU COME UP TO THEM 5 6 AND IT TURNS OUT TO BE A DIFFERENT PERSON? 7 A I GUESS. 8 MR. BARENS: WELL, OBJECTION AS TO SPECULATION. 9 THE COURT: DON'T GUESS. IF YOU RECALL IT EVER HAPPENING IN YOUR LIFE -- DO YOU RECALL THAT EVER HAPPENING? 10 11 THE WITNESS: NO. I DON'T RECALL IT. 12 Q BY MR. WAPNER: YOU DON'T RECALL THAT EVER 13 HAPPENING TO YOU? 14 YOU MEAN COME UP TO A PERSON AND SAY, "HI, I THOUGHT А 15 I REMEMBERED YOU"? 16 0 RIGHT, LOOK AT -- SEE SOMEBODY ON THE STREET OR 17 IN A RESTAURANT OR ANY PLACE AND YOU THOUGHT IT WAS SOMEBODY 18 THAT YOU KNEW AND IT TURNED OUT IT WAS NOT? 19 YEAH. I GUESS IT PROBABLY HAPPENED TO ME. А 20 MR. BARENS: OBJECTION AS TO GUESSING. 21 THE COURT: WHAT IS YOUR BEST RECOLLECTION? 22 THE WITNESS: I --23 THE COURT: DID IT HAPPEN TO YOU OR DIDN'T IT? 24 THE WITNESS: NOT THAT I RECALL RIGHT NOW. 25 THE COURT: ALL RIGHT. 26 BY MR. WAPNER: HAVE YOU EVER MET RON LEVIN? Q 27 А NO. 28 BEFORE THE DATE THAT YOU WERE IN THIS GAS STATION Q

1	AND SAW SOMEONE WHO LOOKED LIKE HIM, HAD YOU EVER SPOKEN TO
2	RON LEVIN?
3	A NO.
4	Q DID YOU KNOW WHO RON LEVIN WAS?
5	A NO.
6	Q AND THE PERSON THAT YOU SAW IN THIS GAS STATION,
7	HAVE YOU EVER SEEN HIM IN PERSON SINCE THEN?
8	A NO.
9	Q YOU WERE ABLE TO SEE THE PERSON THAT WAS WITH THE
10	MAN WITH THE SILVER HAIR, WEREN'T YOU?
11	A REAL SLIGHT. I DIDN'T REALLY PAY ATTENTION TO
12	HIM.
13	Q CAN YOU DESCRIBE HIS BUILD FOR ME?
14	A HE WAS TALL, DARK HAIR. THAT'S ALL I REMEMBER.
15	Q HOW TALL WAS HE IN RELATION TO THE OTHER PERSON?
16	A HE WAS TALLER.
17	THE COURT: TALLER?
18	THE WITNESS: YEAH.
19	THE COURT: ALL RIGHT.
20	Q BY MR. WAPNER: AND HOW TALL WAS HE? WHAT IS YOUR
21	RECOLLECTION OF HOW TALL HE WAS?
22	A I WOULD GUESS ABOUT SIX-FIVE OR SIX-SIX OR
23	SOMETHING.
24	Q SIX-FIVE?
25	A IN THAT AREA, I GUESS.
26	Q DID YOU SAY ON NOVEMBER 22ND THAT HE WAS SIX FEET
27	TALL?
28	A I MIGHT HAVE, YES.

z

1	Q THE TRANSCRIPT OF THE TAPE AT PAGE 17, LOOK AT
2	THE BOTTOM
3	A UH-HUH.
4	Q DO YOU SEE WHERE YOU WERE ASKED HOW TALL HE
5	WAS?
6	A YES.
7	Q HOW TALL DID YOU SAY HE WAS?
8	A SIX FOOT TALL.
9	Q AND WHAT WAS HIS BUILD LIKE?
10	A THIN, I BELIEVE.
11	Q WHAT DO YOU MEAN WHEN YOU SAY "THIN"?
12	A THIN, LANKY, SKINNY.
13	Q DID HE HAVE ANY KIND OF A PAUNCH IN HIS STOMACH?
14	A I DIDN'T I DIDN'T REALLY PAY THAT MUCH
15	ATTENTION.
16	Q DID YOU DESCRIBE HIM AS BEING APPROXIMATELY THE
17	SAME BUILD AS DETECTIVE MEYERS?
18	A YES, BASICALLY.
19	MR. WAPNER: MAY I HAVE A MOMENT?
20	(UNREPORTED COLLOQUY BETWEEN COUNSEL.)
21	MR. WAPNER: DID YOU EVER SEE DETECTIVE MEYERS STANDING
22	UP WHEN YOU WERE AT THE POLICE STATION?
23	A YES, I BELIEVE HE STOOD UP.
24	Q HE WAS PRETTY SLENDER, WASN'T HE?
25	A YES.
26	Q DID YOU COMPARE THE BUILD OF THIS PERSON THAT
27	YOU SAW AS THE COMPANION OF THE ONE WITH THE SILVER HAIR,
28	TO THE BUILD OF DETECTIVE MEYERS?

1	A YES, I BELIEVE SO.
2	Q DID DETECTIVE MEYERS HAVE ANY KIND OF A PAUNCH
3	OR ANYTHING?
4	A NO, HE DIDN'T.
5	Q DID YOU ALSO SAY WHEN YOU WERE ASKED ON NOVEMBER
6	22ND ABOUT THE OTHER PERSON WHO WAS WITH THE MAN WITH THE
7	SILVER HAIR, THAT YOU DIDN'T GET THAT GOOD OF A LOOK AT HIM
8	BECAUSE HE WAS SITTING IN THE CAR?
9	A YES, I DID.
10	Q YOU DIDN'T SAY ANYTHING AT THAT TIME ABOUT SEEING
11	HIM BY THE COKE MACHINE, DID YOU?
12	A NO.
13	Q THE MAN WITH THE SILVER HAIR, WERE YOU ABLE TO
14	WATCH HIM THE WAY HE WALKED? SPECIFICALLY, I AM INTERESTED
15	IN THE SPEED WITH WHICH HE MIGHT HAVE BEEN WALKING.
16	A IT HAS BEEN A WHILE SO I WOULDN'T, I MEAN, STILL
17	RECOLLECT HOW A PERSON WALKS.
18	Q WAS THERE ANYTHING UNUSUAL ABOUT THE PACE WITH
19	WHICH HE WALKED?
20	A I DON'T REMEMBER. I DON'T REMEMBER AT THIS TIME.
21	Q DID YOU HEAR HIM SAY ANY WORDS?
22	A I SAW HIM TALKING TO HIM BUT I DIDN'T HEAR ANY-
23	THING.
24	Q WAS THAT WHEN THE TWO OF THEM WERE IN THE CAR?
25	A NO.
26	WHEN THEY WERE AT THE COKE MACHINE.
27	Q COULD YOU HEAR THE WORDS BUT JUST NOT PAY ANY
28	ATTENTION TO WHAT THE CONTENT WAS OR DID YOU JUST NOT HEAR

.

1	THEM AT ALL?	
2	A I u	UST WASN'T PAYING ATTENTION TO WHAT THEY WERE
3	SAYING.	
4	Q ANY	THING UNUSUAL ABOUT THE WAY THE PERSON TALKED,
5	THE MAN WITH TH	E SILVER HAIR?
6	A ID	ON'T REMEMBER.
7	Q DID	YOU SEE HIM MAKING ANY GESTURES WITH HIS
8	HAND?	
9	A I D	ON'T REMEMBER.
10	Q THE	NIGHT THAT THIS HAPPENED, YOU HAD BEEN AT
11	THE CAFE NAPOLI	WITH CARMEN FOR DINNER, RIGHT?
12	A RIG	HT.
13	Q AND	YOU HAD A BOTTLE OF MATEUS BETWEEN THE TWO
14	OF YOU AT DINNE	R, RIGHT?
15	A RIG	HT.
16	Q HOW	MUCH OF THE BOTTLE DID YOU DRINK?
17	A I H	AD A LITTLE MORE THAN CARMEN DID.
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
i		

BETWEEN THE TWO OF YOU, DID YOU FINISH THE WHOLE 1 Q 2 BOTTLE? 3 А TWO GLASSES -- YES, WE DID. 4 Q HOW MUCH DID SHE HAVE? 5 А I DON'T RECALL RIGHT NOW. AND HOW HAD HOW MANY GLASSES ALTOGETHER? 6 Q 7 А ABOUT TWO OR THREE, I GUESS. 8 DID YOU HAVE A DRINK WITH HER PARENTS AFTER DINNER? 0 9 А NO. YEAH, I HAD COFFEE. HOW LONG AFTER YOU HAD YOUR LAST GLASS OF WINE 10 Q WAS IT THAT YOU SAW THIS PERSON IN THE GAS STATION? 11 A IT WAS A WHILE BECAUSE WE SAT THERE WITH HER PARENTS. 12 AND WE SAT THERE FOR A WHILE AND HAD COFFEE WITH THEM. THEN 13 WE DROVE OVER TO HER HOUSE AND WE WAITED FOR HER PARENTS FOR 14 15 A WHILE. 16 AND THEN WE TOOK OFF FOR THE RANCH. HOW FAR IS IT FROM THE RESTAURANT TO HER PARENTS' 17 Q 18 HOUSE? 19 IT IS A GOOD RIDE. А 20 THE COURT: KEEP YOUR VOICE UP, WILL YOU PLEASE? 21 THE WITNESS: ABOUT THREE OR FOUR MILES, I GUESS. 22 I DON'T KNOW. 23 Q BY MR. WAPNER: SO, WOULD IT TAKE ABOUT FIVE TO 24 SEVEN MINUTES TO GET THERE FROM THE RESTAURANT? 25 A ABOUT TEN MINUTES. TRAFFIC WAS HEAVY. 26 AT THE TIME THAT YOU WERE AT THE GAS STATION, DID Q 27 YOU FEEL ANY OF THE EFFECTS OF THE WINE THAT YOU HAD HAD? 28 A NO. BY THAT TIME IT WAS GONE.

0 CAN YOU DESCRIBE THE CAR THAT YOU SAW AT THE GAS 1 STATION? 2 А ALL I COULD SAY IS THAT IT WAS KIND OF LIKE AN 3 OLDER CAR. IT WAS REALLY A GOOD-LOOKING CAR. IT WAS A WELL-4 KEPT CAR. 5 IT WAS KIND OF LIKE BOXY, I GUESS, SQUARE. 6 WERE YOU SHOWN THIS LINEUP OF CARS THAT IS 234 Q 7 FOR IDENTIFICATION? 8 А YES. 9 0 DID YOU SELECT ONE OF THOSE CARS AS LOOKING MOST 10 LIKE THE CAR THAT YOU SAW? 11 YES. THIS ONE. BUT IT WAS SUCH A BAD -- I MEAN --А 12 Q THE TOP ONE IN THE MIDDLE? 13 А YES. 14 Q WHAT IS WRONG WITH THAT PICTURE? 15 А IT IS NOT THE SAME CAR. 16 Q IS IT THE CLOSEST OF THOSE THAT ARE THERE? 17 А YES, OF THIS, IT WAS THE CLOSEST. 18 CAN YOU DESCRIBE WHAT THE CAR LOOKED LIKE THAT Q 19 20 YOU SAW? А I CAN'T RECALL THAT RIGHT NOW. 21 WAS IT DETECTIVE EDMONDS WHO SHOWED YOU THESE 22 Q PICTURES THAT ARE 234 FOR IDENTIFICATION? 23 24 А WHICH DETECTIVE IS THAT? IT WAS ONE OF THE DETECTIVES FROM BEVERLY HILLS 25 Q 26 POLICE DEPARTMENT WHO CAME? 27 А IT THAT THE COWBOYS? YEAH. IT WAS HIM. AND DID YOU ALSO POINT OUT ANOTHER CAR TO HIM IN 28 Q

1	IN THE PARKING LOT OF THE HIGH SCHOOL?
2	A YES. I THINK I DID.
3	Q WHAT KIND OF CAR WAS THAT, DO YOU REMEMBER?
4	A NO, NOT RIGHT OFF.
5	Q WAS IT A PLYMOUTH VALIANT?
6	A I GUESS.
7	MR. BARENS: WELL YOUR HONOR, I OBJECT TO HIS SAYING,
8	"I GUESS," AS AN ANSWER, SIR.
9	THE COURT: LET'S WHAT DO YOU WANT ME TO DO WITH IT?
10	MR. BARENS: THE INSTRUCTION IS THAT IF HE KNOWS, HE
11	KNOWS. HE CAN SAY THAT.
12	THE COURT: WELL, YOU ASK HIM ABOUT IT.
13	MR. BARENS: IF HE KNOWS, HE KNOWS. WE ARE NOT HERE
14	TO GUESS.
15	THE COURT: WELL, IF ANYBODY SAYS THAT THEY GUESS
16	IS THAT YOUR BEST RECOLLECTION?
17	THE WITNESS: YES, TO MY RECOLLECTION. I DON'T REMEMBER
18	RIGHT NOW.
19	Q BY MR. WAPNER: WOULD IT REFRESH YOUR RECOLLECTION
20	IF YOU LOOKED AT THE BOTTOM OF PAGE 8 OF SERGEANT EDMONDS'
21	REPORT REGARDING THE CAR THAT WAS IN THE PARKING LOT? DOES
22	THAT HELP YOU AT ALL?
23	A NO.
24	Q DID YOU EVER TELL CARMEN THAT YOU DIDN'T WANT HER
25	TO GET INVOLVED IN THIS CASE?
26	A YES I DID.
27	Q WHY DID YOU SAY THAT?
28	A BECAUSE I TOLD HER IT WAS GOING TO TAKE UP A LOT

- 3

1	OF OUR TIME.
2	Q HAD SHE BEEN INVOLVED IN HAD YOU EVER TOLD HER
3	THAT BEFORE IN OTHER CASES, NOT TO GET INVOLVED?
4	A NO.
5	. –
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
1 7	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

.

.

1 0 DID YOU KNOW THAT SHE HAD GONE TO THE POLICE 2 REGARDING OTHER CASES BEFORE? 3 А NO. I HADN'T. 4 0 WHEN DETECTIVE EDHOLM AND SOME OTHER PEOPLE FROM 5 BEVERLY HILLS CAME TO TUCSON ON ONE OF THOSE OCCASIONS, DID 6 THEY ASK YOU TO TRY AND DO A DRAWING, A COMPOSITE DRAWING 7 OF WHAT THIS PERSON LOOKED LIKE? 8 А YES, THEY DID. 9 Q AND DID DETECTIVE EDHOLM HAVE SOMETHING THAT 10 HE CALLED AN IDENTI KIT WITH HIM? 11 А YES, HE DID. 12 MR. BARENS: YOUR HONOR, WE HAVE HAD A PREVIOUS 13 OBJECTION AS TO THE IDENTI KIT MATERIALS, WHICH I BELIEVE 14 THE COURT SUSTAINED. 15 THE COURT: WELL, I DON'T REMEMBER THAT. 16 MR. WAPNER: I DON'T EITHER. 17 THE COURT: LET'S GO ON, WILL YOU? 18 MR. BARENS: ALL RIGHT. 19 Q BY MR. WAPNER: DID HE SHOW YOU -- WELL, CAN 20 YOU EXPLAIN TO US WHAT HAPPENED WHEN YOU TRIED TO DO THAT 21 COMPOSITE PHOTOGRAPH? 22 А YES. 23 THE IDENTI KIT WAS SO LACKING IN STUFF THAT I 24 JUST DID THE BEST I COULD. 25 Q WHAT DO YOU MEAN "LACKING IN STUFF"? 26 А I MEAN I WAS TRYING TO EXPLAIN TO HIM EXACTLY 27 WHAT I THOUGHT THE GUY LOOKED LIKE BUT HE KIND OF WAS 28 LEAFING THROUGH AND HE COULDN'T FIND THE CERTAIN FEATURES

- 1

1	OF THE MAN'S FACE.
2	Q WAS THIS A BOX THAT HAD DIFFERENT KINDS PICTURES
3	OF DIFFERENT KINDS OF EYES AND CHINS?
4	A RIGHT.
5	Q AND CHEEKS AND HAIR AND THINGS LIKE THAT?
6	A UH-HUH.
7	Q YOU HAVE TO SAY "YES" OR "NO" SO SHE CAN WRITE
8	IT.
9	A YES.
10	Q BASED ON ALL OF THOSE DIFFERENT THINGS, DID HE
11	START WITH ONE BASIC FACE AND THEN YOU STARTED CHANGING IT
12	AROUND, PUTTING DIFFERENT KINDS OF EYES AND DIFFERENT HAIR
13	AND THINGS LIKE THAT?
14	A YES.
15	Q HOW LONG DID YOU SIT WITH HIM AND DO THAT?
16	A I WOULD SAY ABOUT AN HOUR.
17	Q AND WHAT HAPPENED AT THE END OF THAT HOUR?
18	A I TOLD HIM IT WAS LIKE THE BEST I COULD DO WITH
19	WHAT HE HAD.
20	Q AND SHOWING YOU AN ITEM THAT I WOULD LIKE TO
21	HAVE MARKED AS 240 FOR IDENTIFICATION, DO YOU RECOGNIZE THIS?
22	A YES.
23	Q WHAT IS IT?
24	A THAT IS THE "COMPUSITORY" I DID FOR HIM.
25	Q IS THAT A RESULT OF THE IDENTI KIT WORK THAT
26	YOU DID AFTER SPENDING AN HOUR WITH
27	A RIGHT.
28	Q DETECTIVE EDHOLM?

يند. ويوري

4	
1	A YES.
2	Q AND DID YOU MAKE ANY STATEMENTS TO DETECTIVE
3	EDHOLM AS TO HOW CLOSE THAT WAS TO THE PERSON THAT YOU SAW?
4	A I SAID "THIS IS ABOUT AS CLOSE AS I COULD GET
5	WITH THE STUFF HE HAD TO WORK WITH."
6	Q DID YOU TELL HIM THAT IT BASICALLY RESEMBLED
7	THE PERSON EXCEPT THAT HIS CHIN WAS MORE SCULPTURED AND THAT
8	THE HAIR WAS ALL RIGHT, EXCEPT THAT IT WAS PUSHED BACK?
9	A YES, SOMETHING LIKE THAT AND THE EYES WEREN'T
10	CORRECT. THEY EYES WEREN'T TOTALLY RIGHT.
11	HE COULDN'T FIND THE RIGHT EYES FOR HIM.
12	Q DID YOU TELL HIM THAT, TOO?
13	A YEAH, YEAH, I BELIEVE I DID.
14	Q I WANT TO SHOW YOU A REPORT PREPARED BY DETECTIVE
15	EDHOLM, AND LOOK AT THE TOP PARAGRAPH ON THAT PAGE AND SEE
16	IF THAT REFRESHES YOUR RECOLLECTION AT ALL AS TO WHAT YOU
17	SAID TO THE DETECTIVE?
18	A UH-HUH.
19	Q DOE S IT?
20	A SOMETHING LIKE IT.
21	'Q WHAT WAS IT THAT YOU SAID TO DETECTIVE EDHOLM?
22	A HUH?
23	Q WHAT WAS IT THAT YOU SAID TO HIM?
24	A BASICALLY THE SAME THING, AND I TOLD HIM THAT
25	THE EYES WEREN'T QUITE RIGHT.
26	Q WHAT DOES THAT SAY THAT YOU SAID TO HIM?
27	THE WITNESS: OH, THIS?
28	MR. BARENS: DO YOU WANT HIM TO READ THE POLICE REPORT

-2

1	INTO EVIDENCE?
2	THE COURT: WELL, IF IT FAIRLY REPRESENTS WHAT YOU
3	SAID TO HIM AND IT REFRESHES YOUR RECOLLECTION.
4	THE WITNESS: WELL, SOMEWHAT, IT REPRESENTS BUT THEN
5	I SAID SOMETHING ELSE, I BELIEVE.
6	THE COURT: YES, GO AHEAD.
7	THE WITNESS: I SAID
8	MR. BARENS: WELL, I DON'T BELIEVE THE COURT HAS
9	INSTRUCTED HIM TO READ A POLICE REPORT.
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	+
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

1 Q MR. LOPEZ, DID YOU SAY TO HIM THAT THE CHIN WAS 2 MORE SCULPTURED AND THE HAIR WAS OKAY BUT COMBED STRAIGHT BACK? 3 А RIGHT. 4 0 AND HE DOESN'T MAKE ANY MENTION THERE OF THE EYES 5 BEING DIFFERENT, DOES HE? 6 А HE MIGHT HAVE FORGOT. 7 MR. BARENS: OBJECTION AS TO RELEVANCY. WHAT THE OFFICER 8 FAILED TO PUT IN OR DID PUT IN IS NOT RELEVANT. WHAT HE SAYS 9 IS WHAT IS RELEVANT. 10 THE COURT: I WILL SUSTAIN THE OBJECTION. 11 MR. WAPNER: MAY 240 BE RECEIVED INTO EVIDENCE, YOUR 12 HONOR? 13 MR. BARENS: WE OBJECT. 14 THE COURT: IT WILL BE RECEIVED. 15 MR. BARENS: DO YOU WANT TO HEAR THE OBJECTION IF YOU 16 ARE RECEIVING IT INTO EVIDENCE, YOUR HONOR? 17 THE COURT: WELL, WE HAD RECEIVED HIS DESCRIPTION OF 18 WHAT IT IS THAT HE TESTIFIED WITH RESPECT TO THAT PARTICULAR 19 COMPOSITE. 20 MR. BARENS: YOUR HONOR, THE RELIABILITY OF THE COMPOSITE 21 FOR THE JURY IS HIGHLY SUSPECT. 22 THE COURT: LET THE JURY DETERMINE THAT. I WILL ADMIT 23 IT. 24 MR. WAPNER: MAY I JUST PASS IT AMONG THE JURORS, YOUR 25 HONOR? 26 THE COURT: YES. 27 (PAUSE.) 28 BY MR. WAPNER: WHAT COLOR WERE THE EYES OF THE Q

- 1

MAN THAT HAD THE SILVER HAIR? 1 2 А I DON'T REMEMBER. 3 WERE YOU ABLE TO SEE THE COLOR? 0 I MIGHT HAVE. I JUST DON'T REMEMBER. 4 А 5 0 WHAT WAS IT THAT MADE YOU THINK THE PERSON WAS GAY? 6 7 MR. BARENS: ASKED AND ANSWERED EXTENSIVELY, YOUR HONOR. 8 MR. WAPNER: I DON'T THINK I ASKED THE QUESTION ONCE. 9 COUNSEL MAY HAVE ASKED IT. THE COURT MAY HAVE ASKED IT. 10 THE COURT: HE MAY ANSWER IT AGAIN. THE WITNESS: HE JUST GAVE OFF THIS CERTAIN THING THAT 11 JUST -- YOU SAID THAT THIS GUY IS GAY. 12 13 Q BY MR. WAPNER: OKAY. WELL, THE FIRST THING I WANT TO DO IS PUT ASIDE THE FACT THAT HE WAS WITH ANYBODY ELSE. 14 15 JUST CONCENTRATE ON HIM ALONE. 16 WHAT WAS IT ABOUT HIM IF YOU RECALL ANYTHING 17 SPECIFIC, THAT MADE YOU THINK THAT HE WAS GAY? 18 MR. BARENS: YOUR HONOR, WE OBJECT TO THE QUESTION AS 19 MISLEADING THE WITNESS. HE EARLIER TESTIFIED --20 THE COURT: HE PREVIOUSLY TESTIFIED, DID HE? LET HIM 21 TESTIFY AGAIN. THIS IS CROSS-EXAMINATION. 22 MR. BARENS: BUT YOUR HONOR, THE QUESTION IS MISLEADING. 23 HE SAID IN THE EARLIER TESTIMONY THAT HE MADE HIS 24 IDENTIFICATION --25 THE COURT: DON'T REMIND HIM AS TO WHAT HE SAID 26 PREVIOUSLY. 27 MR. BARENS: COULD WE APPROACH AND TELL YOU? 28 THE COURT: YES. YOU CAN TELL THAT TO ME BUT NOT TO

1	HIM.
2	MR. BARENS: THAT IS WHY IT IS MISLEADING. THANK YOU.
3	(THE FOLLOWING PROCEEDINGS WERE HELD
4	AT THE BENCH:)
5	THE COURT: WHAT IS YOUR OBJECTION?
6	MR. BARENS: YOUR HONOR, THE WITNESS PREVIOUSLY TESTIFIED
7	THAT HIS SENSE OF THE SILVER-HAIRED MAN AS BEING GAY WAS BASED
8	ON AN OVERALL SENSE HE HAD BECAUSE OF THE PERSON HE WAS WITH
9	AND
10	THE COURT: THIS IS CROSS-EXAMINATION. LET HIM HAVE
11	A CHANCE TO ASK HIM AGAIN.
12	MR. BARENS: PARDON ME, YOUR HONOR. THE WITNESS CLEARLY
13	INDICATED BOTH TO THE COURT AND TO ME ON EXAMINATION, THAT
14	PART OF WHY HE FELT THAT HE WAS GAY IS BECAUSE OF THE OTHER
15	MAN HE WAS WITH.
16	NOW, MR. WAPNER SAYS TO HIM, MAKE THE
17	IDENTIFICATION WITHOUT IN YOUR OWN MIND WITHOUT REFERENCE
18	TO THE MAN HE WAS WITH AND THAT IS MISLEADING BECAUSE HE
19	ALREADY SAID THAT THAT IS PART OF HOW HE DID IT.
20	THE COURT: WELL, THE OTHER MAN BEING GAY BRUSHES OFF
21	ON HIM, SO HE IS GAY?
22	MR. BARENS: WELL, HE SEEMS TO SAY THAT THE ASSOCIATION
23	HAD A BEARING IN HIS MIND.
24	THE COURT: IT IS CROSS-EXAMINATION.
25	MR. BARENS: THANK YOU.
26	
27	
28	

1 (THE FOLLOWING PROCEEDINGS WERE HELD IN 2 OPEN COURT IN THE HEARING AND PRESENCE 3 OF THE JURY:) 4 BY MR. WAPNER: JUST CONCENTRATING ON THE PERSON, Q 5 THE ONE WITH THE SILVER HAIR, WHAT WAS IT ABOUT HIM THAT 6 MADE YOU THINK HE WAS GAY? 7 IT'S REALLY HARD TO EXPLAIN, I DON'T KNOW. А 8 HOW DO YOU EXPLAIN A PERSON IS GAY? 9 Q I DON'T KNOW. 10 HOW DO YOU EXPLAIN IT ?-11 А I JUST GET THIS FEELING ABOUT IT, THAT HE IS 12 GAY AND YOU SAY "HEY, WELL, HE IS GAY." 13 WELL, IF YOU CAN TRY AND RECALL WHAT IT WAS THAT Q 14 YOU BASED YOUR FEELING ON. 15 А THE OVERALL GUY, I MEAN. 16 WHAT ABOUT HIM, THOUGH, WHAT ABOUT THE OVERALL Q 17 GUY? 18 А AH, I DON'T KNOW. I JUST CAN'T EXPLAIN. 19 I JUST GET THIS FEELING THAT THIS GUY IS GAY, 20 SO HE IS GAY. 21 DID YOU SAY ON NOVEMBER 22ND THAT WHEN YOU WERE Q 22 ASKED WHY HE WAS GAY, DID YOU SAY, "WELL, I DON'T KNOW. JUST 23 THE WAY HE WAS DRESSED. HIS -- YEAH, HIS JEANS WERE JUST 24 A LITTLE TOO TIGHT"? 25 А YEAH. 26 ANYTHING ELSE ABOUT -- WHAT WAS IT ABOUT THE Q 27 FACT THAT HIS JEANS WERE TOO TIGHT THAT MADE YOU THINK HE 28 WAS GAY?

1	A HE WAS WEARING I GUESS HE WAS WEARING DESIGNER
2	JEANS WHICH IS I DON'T KNOW ABOUT YOU BUT BUT AN OLDER
3	MAN LIKE THAT WEARING DESIGNER JEANS IN THAT AREA AND STUFF,
4	I DON'T KNOW.
5	Q A GUY IN HIS 40'S?
6	A RIGHT.
7	Q WEARING DESIGNER JEANS NEAR THE UNIVERSITY OF
8	ARIZONA?
9	A YES, BASICALLY.
10	Q SO THAT MAKES HIM GAY?
11	MR. BARENS: OBJECTION.
12	THE WITNESS: NO, IT DOESN'T MAKE HIM GAY.
13	MR. BARENS: OBJECTION. THE QUESTION IS MISLEADING.
14	THE COURT: I WILL STRIKE THE ANSWER. AND I SUSTAIN
15	THE OBJECTION.
16	Q BY MR. WAPNER: YOU SAID BEFORE THAT YOU HAD
17	SEEN PEOPLE WHO APPEARED STRAIGHT BUT WERE GAY, DO YOU
18	REMEMBER MAKING THAT STATEMENT?
19	A YES.
20	Q HOW DID YOU KNOW THAT THEY WERE GAY?
21	A THEY I FOUND OUT LATER.
22	Q THE PEOPLE TOLD YOU?
23	A NO. I WAS TOLD BY SOMEBODY ELSE.
24	Q OKAY. BUT THERE WAS NOTHING ABOUT THOSE PEOPLE
25	IN THEIR APPEARANCE THAT MADE YOU THINK THEY WERE GAY?
26	A RIGHT.
27	Q ON THIS OCCASION, WAS IT THE FACT THAT YOU, FIRST
28	OF ALL, HAD SEEN THE COMPANION AND, SECOND OF ALL, TALKED

1 TO CARMEN ABOUT IT, THAT MADE YOU FEEL THAT PERHAPS THIS 2 GUY WAS GAY? 3 A I GOT AN OVERALL GIST FIRST AND WHEN I TALKED TO 4 CARMEN, I KIND OF CONFIRMED IT, BESIDES HIS PARTNER, YES. 5 Q ANYTHING ABOUT THE PARTNER INDEPENDENT OF THE 6 OTHER PERSON THAT MADE YOU THINK HE WAS GAY? 7 A I REALLY DIDN'T GET A GREAT LOOK AT HIM. 8 THE COURT: PARDON ME? 9 THE WITNESS: I SAID I DIDN'T REALLY GET A GREAT LOOK 10 AT THE GUY. 11 IT WAS JUST KIND OF LIKE I SAW HIM WHEN THEY 12 WERE TOGETHER AND THAT WAS BASICALLY IT. 13 Q BY MR. WAPNER: SO IT WAS MOSTLY TALKING TO CARMEN 14 AFTER THE FACT? 15 YEAH, WE DISCUSSED IT AFTERWARDS, YES. А 16 0 DID YOU SEE ANY MARKS OR SCARS ON THE PERSON? 17 MR. BARENS: BEFORE WE LEAVE THAT, I AM GOING TO OBJECT TO 18 THAT AND ASK THAT THE ANSWER BE STRICKEN AS NON-RESPONSIVE. 19 COUNSEL SAYS "IT WAS MOSTLY" AND THE WITNESS ANSWERED "WELL, 20 WE DISCUSSED IT AFTERWARDS." THE "MOSTLY" WAS NOT RESPONDED 21 TO BY THE WITNESS. 22 THE COURT: YOU CAN CLEAR IT UP ON REDIRECT. 23 MR. BARENS: WELL, I THINK, YOUR HONOR --24 THE COURT: WELL, LET'S CLEAR IT UP ON REDIRECT, IF 25 YOU WILL, PLEASE, HANDLE IT THAT WAY, WILL YOU? 26 MR. BARENS: ALL RIGHT. 27 0 BY MR. WAPNER: DID YOU SEE ANY SCARS OR MARKS 28 ON THE FACE OF THE MAN WITH THE SILVER HAIR?

3

1	A I DON'T RECOLLECT ANY.
2	(MR. CHIER ENTERS THE COURTROOM.)
3	Q DID YOU TELL DETECTIVE EDMONDS, THE PERSON WHO
4	TALKED TO YOU IN THE PARKING LOT OF THE GYM AT TUCSON HIGH
5	SCHOOL, THAT HE HAD NO VISIBLE SCARS?
6	A I DIDN'T SAY THAT.
7	I SAID I DIDN'T REMEMBER ANY.
8	Q SO IF THAT IS WHAT HE WROTE DOWN, THEN HE MUST
9	HAVE GOTTEN THAT WRONG?
10	A YES.
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

Q YOU DIDN'T REMEMBER ANY SCARS THEN AND YOU DON'T 1 REMEMBER ANY SCARS NOW? IS THAT WHAT YOU ARE SAYING? 2 NO. I DON'T. А 3 HAVE YOU BEEN STAYING IN A MOTEL SINCE YOU HAVE Q 4 BEEN IN TOWN WAITING TO TESTIFY? 5 YES I HAVE. A 6 WHEN YOU WERE FIRST SHOWN A GROUP OF PHOTOGRAPHS Q 7 AT THE TUCSON POLICE STATION THE DAY THAT I WAS THERE WITH 8 DETECTIVE MACMAC, YOU WERE READ AN ADMONITION ABOUT NOT 9 DISCUSSING YOUR IDENTIFICATION WITH ANYBODY, RIGHT? 10 A YES. 11 AND THE DAY THAT YOU MADE THE IDENTIFICATION, DID 0 12 YOU DISCUSS IT WITH CARMEN? 13 А NO, NOT ABOUT THE PERSON. NO. 14 THE COURT: YOU DIDN'T DISCUSS IT WITH HER AT ALL? 15 THE WITNESS: NO. 16 BY MR. WAPNER: DID YOU EVER DISCUSS IT WITH HER 0 17 AFTER THAT DAY? 18 A NO. WE DISCUSSED BASICALLY WHAT WE TALKED ABOUT 19 IN THE ROOM. 20 DID YOU DISCUSS WHETHER OR NOT YOU HAD PICKED OUT 21 Q 22 ANY PARTICULAR PHOTOGRAPH? WE MIGHT HAVE. I DON'T REMEMBER. 23 А 24 Q DID YOU TELL EHR WHICH ONE YOU HAD PICKED? А I DON'T REMEMBER. 25 26 DID YOU DISCUSS WITH HER THE FACT THAT YOU BOTH Q THOUGHT THAT YOU HAD PICKED THE RIGHT PERSON? 27 YEAH. WE DID DISCUSS THAT. А 28

12280

.

-1

1	Q WHEN DID YOU DISCUSS THAT?
2	A RIGHT AFTER OUR MEETING WITH MR. FILIPPELLI.
3	Q SO THAT WAS THE SAME DAY, WHICH WAS NOVEMBER THE
4	22ND OF 1986?
5	A RIGHT. YES.
6	Q DID YOU EVER DISCUSS IT ON ANOTHER DAY BETWEEN
7	THEN AND THE TIME THAT YOU WERE CONTACTED BY SOMEBODY FROM
8	THE DEFENSE IN THIS CASE AS TO THE FACT THAT YOU HAD PICKED
9	THE CORRECT PERSON?
10	A YOU MEAN CAN YOU
11	MR. BARENS: OBJECTION, MISLEADING. WE DON'T KNOW WHAT
12	CORRECT PERSON MEANS, JUDGE.
13	THE COURT: SAME PERSON.
14	Q BY MR. WAPNER: DID YOU DISCUSS
15	MR. BARENS: WELL, I THINK THAT WE SHOULD MAKE SURE THAT
16	WE ARE TALKING ABOUT THE SAME OR CORRECT
17	THE COURT: GO OVER THAT, PLEASE. ASK HIM WHICH ONE
18	HE PICKED OUT. WE KNOW CARMEN PICKED OUT THE SAME ONE. WE
19	DON'T HAVE TO GO AROUND.
20	Q BY MR. WAPNER: DID YOU DISCUSS WITH CARMEN THE
21	FACT THAT THE TWO OF YOU HAD PICKED OUT THE SAME PICTURE?
22	A YES.
23	Q DID THAT REINFORCE YOUR BELIEF THAT YOU HAD PICKED
24	OUT THE PERSON THAT YOU SAW AT THE GAS STATION?
25	A THAT WE PICKED SOMEBODY OUT, YES.
26	Q NOW, DID YOU DISCUSS IT WITH HER MORE THAN ONCE
27	BETWEEN THE TIME OF NOVEMBER THE 22ND AND THE TIME YOU WERE
28	CONTACTED BY SOMEBODY FROM THE DEFENSE IN THIS CASE?
1	

A IN JUST CONVERSATION, PROBABLY. NOT TO SIT DOWN 1 TO REMEMBER IT. 2 Q SORRY? 3 FIRST OF ALL, I WAS TOTALLY OPPOSED TO IT, TO А 4 TALKING ABOUT THIS BECAUSE I FELT THAT IT WAS REALLY PUTTING 5 A LOT OF STRESS ON HER. 6 I TOLD HER WHEN SHE STARTED TALKING ABOUT IT, I 7 SAID, "WHY DON'T YOU JUST LEAVE IT BEHIND YOU BECAUSE IT IS 8 JUST PUTTING SO MUCH STRESS ON YOU RIGHT NOW." 9 WE TALKED ABOUT IT. WE TALKED ABOUT IT LIKE REAL 10 SLIGHTLY IN CONVERSATION. 11 WHEN YOU TALKED ABOUT IT IN CONVERSATION, DID YOU Q 12 TRY TO REASSURE HER ABOUT ANY IDENTIFICATION THAT SHE HAD MADE? 13 A NO. 14 WHEN YOU CAME HERE -- WELL, WHEN MR. CHIER CAME 0 15 TO TUCSON AND SHOWED YOU THE PHOTOGRAPHS THAT ARE 235, WERE 16 YOU AND CARMEN TOGETHER AT THAT TIME? 17 А YES. 18 Q IN THE SAME ROOM? 19 А YES. 20 WHO WAS THERE BESIDES THE TWO OF YOU AND MR. CHIER? Q 21 A CARMEN'S LAWYER. 22 DID MR. CHIER SAY ANYTHING, READ ANY ADMONITION 23 Q TO YOU AT THAT TIME? 24 25 MR. BARENS: OBJECTION AS TO RELEVANCY, SINCE COUNSEL ARE NOT POLICE OFFICERS AND --26 27 THE COURT: OVERRULED. MR. BARENS: THAT WAS A CLOSE ONE. 28

1 Q BY MR. WAPNER: ALL RIGHT. DID MR. CHIER READ YOU AN ADMONITION AT THAT TIME? 2 3 А I DON'T REMEMBER. DID HE GIVE YOU ANY CAUTION AT ALL? Q 4 А 5 I CAN'T REMEMBER. 6 0 WHAT DID HE SAY TO YOU WHEN HE SHOWED YOU THE 7 PICTURES? 8 A "WAS THIS THE LINEUP," I BELIEVE IS WHAT HE SAID. "WAS THIS THE LINEUP THAT WAS SHOWN BY MR. WAPNER AND 9 10 MR. MEYERS," I BELIEVE. 11 Q DID HE ASK YOU WHETHER YOU COULD PICK ANYBODY OUT 12 AT THAT TIME? 13 А NO. HE ASKED US WHICH ONE DID WE PICK OUT, I BELIEVE. 14 15 Q DID YOU TELL HIM? 16 А I BELIEVE WE DID. 17 Q AND DID CARMEN ALSO TELL HIM? 18 А YES. I BELIEVE SO. 19 Q SO YOU WERE BOTH THERE IN THE SAME ROOM AT THE 20 SAME TIME? 21 А YES. 22 SO, YOU KNEW FOR SURE, YOU BOTH KNEW THAT YOU Q 23 PICKED THE SAME PERSON, RIGHT? 24 А YEAH. 25 WAS ANYTHING ELSE SAID BY MR. CHIER ABOUT THE Q 26 PICTURES AT THAT TIME? 27 NO, NOT REALLY. I DON'T RECALL. IT HAS BEEN A А 28 WHILE.

1	Q WHEN YOU KNEW THAT YOU WERE BOTH GOING TO HAVE	
2	TO COME TO LOS ANGELES TO TESTIFY, DID YOU AND CARMEN TALK	
3	TO EACH OTHER ABOUT THE FACT THAT YOU HAD BOTH PICKED THE SAME	
4	PICTURE?	
5	A I GUESS WE DID, YEAH.	
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21	•	
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

F

1 WHEN YOU WERE IN THE ROOM WITH MR. CHIER IN TUCSON Q AND YOU BOTH PICKED THE SAME PICTURE, DID THAT MAKE YOU MORE 2 SURE THAT YOU HAD IN FACT PICKED THE PERSON THAT YOU HAD 3 4 SEEN AT THE GAS STATION? 5 А NO. 6 HOW DID IT MAKE YOU FEEL WHEN YOU KNEW THAT CARMEN Q 7 HAD IN FACT PICKED THE SAME PERSON AS YOU? 8 A AS I SAID BEFORE, WE BASICALLY HAD A GIST THAT 9 WE HAD PICKED OUT THE RIGHT PICTURE BECAUSE WE WERE GOING 10 THROUGH THIS THING ALREADY. 11 WHAT DO YOU MEAN WHEN YOU SAY "THE RIGHT PICTURE"? Q 12 А WELL, THE FACT THAT WE WERE KEPT AT THAT STATION 13 FOR TEN HOURS, BASICALLY, CLUED US IN THAT YOU GUYS WERE 14 AFTER US BECAUSE WE HAD IDENTIFIED SOMEBODY. 15 WHEN YOU SAY "THE RIGHT PICTURE," WHAT DO YOU Q 16 MEAN? 17 THE ONE YOU GUYS DIDN'T WANT US TO CHOOSE, THAT А 18 IS THE ONE. 19 MR. WAPNER: MAY THAT BE STRICKEN AS CALLING FOR A 20 CONCLUSION BY THE WITNESS? 21 THE COURT: YES. 22 YOU JUST ANSWER THE QUESTION. 23 THE WITNESS: I DID ANSWER THE QUESTION, SIR. 24 MR. BARENS: YOUR HONOR --25 THE COURT: I WILL STRIKE IT. 26 GO AHEAD AND ASK THE NEXT QUESTION. 27 MR. BARENS: THAT IS WHAT HE MEANT. 28 THE COURT: ASK THE QUESTION YOURSELF.

- 1

1	MR. BARENS: COUNSEL ASKED HIM WHAT HE MEANT AND THAT
2	IS WHAT HE ANSWERED. COUNSEL JUST DIDN'T LIKE THE ANSWER.
3	THE COURT: GO AHEAD.
4	MR. WAPNER: THE CONCLUSION AS TO WHAT WE WANTED IS
5	WHAT I ASKED TO HAVE STRICKEN.
6	THE COURT: THAT PART, I AM STRIKING.
7	Q BY MR. WAPNER: WHEN YOU CAME TO LOS ANGELES
8	AND YOU WENT AT SOME POINT TO MR. BARENS' OFFICE, RIGHT?
9	A YES.
10	Q AND YOU WERE WITH CARMEN AT THAT TIME?
11	A YES.
12	Q YOU WERE AGAIN SHOWN THE PHOTOGRAPHS THAT ARE
13	MRKED 235 FOR IDENTIFICATION?
14	A YES.
15	Q AND THEN YOU WERE SHOWN SOME OTHER PICTURES,
16	TOO, RIGHT? YOU WERE ALSO SHOWN SOME OTHER PICTURES?
17	A RIGHT.
18	Q WHICH OF THE OTHER PICTURES WERE YOU SHOWN?
19	MR. BARENS: I BELIEVE THIS WAS ALL ASKED DIRECTLY
20	AND ANSWERED BY COUNSEL SPEAKING NOW.
21	MR. WAPNER: CERTAINLY NOT ALL OF IT.
22	THE COURT: GO AHEAD.
23	Q BY MR. WAPNER: YOU WERE SHOWN THREE PICTURES
24	THAT ARE PEOPLE'S 6, PEOPLE'S 153 AND PEOPLE'S 154, CORRECT?
25	A RIGHT.
26	Q WHICH ONE WERE YOU SHOWN FIRST?
27	A THE BLOWUP, THE BIG ONE.
28	Q THAT WOULD BE PEOPLE'S 6?

- 2

. - .

1 А RIGHT. 2 Q OKAY. AND DID CARMEN SAY ANYTHING WHEN THAT 3 PICTURE WAS SHOWN? 4 А NO, I BELIEVE NOT. 5 WHAT WAS SAID BY MR. BARENS OR MR. CHIER OR THEIR 0 6 INVESTIGATOR AT THE TIME THESE PICTURES WERE SHOWN? 7 HE GAVE US THE WARNING THAT HE WAS --А 8 THE COURT: HE WHAT? 9 THE WITNESS: HE GAVE US A WARNING THAT THIS WAS IN 10 NO WAY TO -- SOMETHING ABOUT OUR JUDGMENT TO ENHANCE THAT THIS WAS THE GUY OR ANYTHING. 11 HE JUST SAID, "THIS IS JUST PICTURES THAT WE 12 13 ARE GOING TO PUT UP." 14 BY MR. WAPNER: WHO GAVE YOU THIS WARNING? Q 15 А MR. BARENS DID. 16 THE COURT: DIDN'T HE TELL YOU THAT IT WAS AN EXHIBIT 17 IN THIS CASE AND THAT THAT ACTUALLY WAS A PICTURE OF THE 18 MISSING MAN? 19 THE WITNESS: NO. 20 THE COURT: HE DIDN'T TELL YOU THAT? 21 THE WITNESS: NO. 22 THE COURT: ALL RIGHT. 23 BY MR. WAPNER: AND WHAT WAS THE NEXT PICTURE Q 24 THAT YOU WERE SHOWN? 25 А I BLEIEVE THE ONE WITH THE DOG. 26 AND WHAT DID CARMEN SAY WHEN THIS PICTURE WAS 0 27 SHOWN? 28 SHE DIDN'T SAY ANYTHING. А

-3

,

1	Q	WHAT DID YOU SAY?
2	А	THEN IS WHEN I SAID "THAT IS THE PICTURE THAT
3	REALLY CLEAF	RED IT UP FOR ME," THAT THAT WAS BASICALLY THE
4	GUY WE SAW.	
5	Q	IS THAT WHAT YOU SAID OUT LOUD AT THE TIME YOU
6	WERE IN MR.	BAREN'S OFFICE?
7	А	I BELIEVE SO.
8	Q	DID CARMEN SAY ANYTHING WHEN YOU SAID THAT?
9	A	I BELIVE SHE WAS JUST LOOKING AT THE OTHER.
10	Q	DID SHE SAY ANYTHING WHEN YOU MADE YOUR COMMENTS
11	ABOUT PEOPLE	E'S 154?
12	A	NO, I DON'T THINK SO.
13	Q	THEN THE NEXT PICTURE YOU WERE SHOWN WAS 153?
14	А	YES.
15	Q	WHAT HAPPENED WHEN YOU WERE SHOWN 153?
16	А	CARMEN SAID THAT IS THE PICTURE THAT SHE THOUGHT
17	Q	WHEN SHE SAID THAT IS THE PICTURE, IS THAT ALL
18	SHE SAID?	
19	А	NO.
20		SHE SAID SOMETHING ELSE, I AM SURE. I JUST DON'T
21	REMEMBER IT	RIGHT NOW.
22	Q	DID SHE DO ANYTHING BESIDES MAKING STATEMENTS?
23	А	LIKE WHAT?
24	Q	ANYTHING.
25	А	LIKE YOU MEAN HAND GESTURES OR
26	Q	ANYTHING ELSE BESIDES JUST SAYING, "THIS IS THE
27	ONE"?	
28	А	I AM SURE SHE SAID SOMETHING ELSE. I MEAN SHE

э. 1941 1941

.,

ł

. 1 WAS TALKING. 2 0 DID SHE SEEM TO HAVE ANY REACTION IN PARTICULAR 3 TO THIS PICTURE, 153, OTHER THAN THE FACT OF SAYING "THIS 4 IS THE ONE"? 5 SHE WAS LOOKING AT IT, YEAH. А 6 Q INCIDENTALLY, YOU AND CARMEN WERE ASKED TO DO 7 THIS IDENTI KIT ON THE SAME DAY; IS THAT RIGHT? 8 А YES. 9 Q AND THAT WAS AT HER PARENTS' HOUSE IN RIO RICO? 10 А YES. 11 MR. WAPNER: THANK YOU. I HAVE NOTHING FURTHER. 12 THE COURT: ALL RIGHT, REDIRECT. 13 MR. BARENS: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR. 14 15 REDIRECT EXAMINATION 16 BY MR. BARENS: 17 Q GOOD MORNING, SIR. 18 А GOOD MORNING. 19 Q HAVE YOU AT ANY TIME EVER, SINCE SEPTEMBER OF 20 1986, TO THE PRESENT, LOOKED AT THE ESQUIRE MAGAZINE. WHICH 21 I WILL SHOW YOU HERE, THAT HAS TIM MC CARVER'S PICTURE ON 22 THE COVER, HAVE YOU EVER LOOKED AT THAT? 23 THE COURT: ON DIRECT EXAMINATION, HE SAID HE HAD NEVER 24 SEEN THAT, NEVER READ IT. 25 MR. BARENS: I AM ASKING FROM ANY TIME UNTIL THEN --26 THE WITNESS: NO, NEVER. 27 MR. BARENS: -- UNTIL THIS MOMENT. 28 THE WITNESS: NO, NEVER HAVE.

1	THE	COURT: UN	TIL THIS	VERY MOMENT?		
2	MR.	BARENS: UN	TIL THIS	VERY MOMENT,	ACTUALLY.	
3	ТНЕ	WITNESS: N	O, NEVER	HAVE, NEVER	READ IT.	
4						
5						
6						
7						
8						
9						
10						
11						
12						
13						
14						
15						
16						
17						
18						
19						
20						
21						
22						
23						
24						
25						
26						
27						
28						
l						

Q THE MAN YOU SAW WITH THE SILVER HAIR, YOU DESCRIBED 1 AS A PERSON THAT LOOKED TO YOU AS SOMEONE WHO WORKED OUT, IS 2 THAT CORRECT? 3 А YES. 4 WHEN YOU SAY "WORKING OUT," YOU NECESSARILY MEAN Q 5 OR DO YOU IN THIS INSTANCE, MEAN SOMEONE WHO WORKS OUT WITH 6 WEIGHTS? 7 NO, JUST SOMEBODY THAT MAY RUN OR DOES A LITTLE А 8 ROWING OR SOMETHING. SOMETHING LIKE THAT. 9 SOMEONE THAT STAYS TRIM? Q 10 А STAYS TRIM, EXACTLY. 11 ALL RIGHT. WHEN YOU LOOKED AT THIS SILVER-HAIRED Q 12 MAN, DID YOU SEE ANY DEFINED BICEPS? 13 А NOT REALLY DEFINED BICEPS, NO. 14 Q DID YOU SEE BICEPS THAT LOOKED TO YOU LIKE ANY 15 GUY WHO PUMPED IRON? 16 А NO. 17 Q ALL RIGHT. YOU HAVE SEEN THOSE KINDS OF GUYS IN 18 THE WRESTLING GYM, HAVE YOU NOT? 19 20 А YES. THESE ARE PEOPLE THAT IF THEY ARE WEARING A POLO 0 21 22 SHIRT, HAVE NOTICEABLE BICEPS? 23 А YES. I HAVE WRESTLED THEM BEFORE, YEAH. 24 Q NOTABLE FOREARMS? 25 А YES. ALL RIGHT. ARE THOSE THE ARMS THAT YOU SAW ON 26 Q THE MAN WITH THE SILVER HAIR? 27 28 Α NO.

DID YOU FEEL THAT HE WORKED OUT BECAUSE HE WAS Q 1 TRIM FOR A PERSON OF HIS ADVANCED YEARS? 2 YES, DEFINITELY. А 3 IN LOOKING AT ME, DO I LOOK LIKE A PERSON WHO WORKS Q 4 OUT TO YOU? 5 А YES, DEFINITELY. 6 ALL RIGHT. WAS YOUR ATTENTION PRIMARILY FOCUSED Q 7 ON THE MAN WITH THE SILVER HAIR'S FACE? 8 А YES IT WAS. 9 WAS THAT WHAT HAD YOUR ATTENTION MOST OF THE TIME 0 10 THAT YOU WERE OBSERVING HIM? 11 А YES. 12 THE OTHER MAN THAT YOU SAW WITH THE MAN WITH THE Q 13 SILVER HAIR, DID YOU PAY ANY PARTICULAR ATTENTION TO HIM? 14 А NO, NOT REALLY. 15 DID YOU PAY ANY PARTICULAR ATTENTION TO HIS HEIGHT? Q 16 А NOT REALLY. BUT THEN, HE WAS STANDING ON -- I 17 WOULD SAY HE WAS DRINKING A COKE. HE WAS PROBABLY STANDING 18 RIGHT BY THE MACHINE, SO --19 Q WAS HE STANDING ON AN ELEVATED AREA? IN OTHER 20 WORDS, THE MACHINE IS ON LIKE A CURVED AREA, ELEVATED ABOVE 21 THE SURFACE? 22 23 А RIGHT. 24 WAS THAT AREA ELEVATED ABOVE THE SURFACE THAT YOU Q WERE STANDING ON WHEN YOU OBSERVED HIM? 25 26 А YES. 27 DO YOU KNOW HOW MANY INCHES OF CURBING OR ELEVATION Q THERE WAS FOR THE AREA HE WAS STANDING ON? IN OTHER WORDS, 28

HOW MUCH HIGHER IT WAS OFF THE GROUND IN THAT AREA THAN THE 1 AREA YOU WERE STANDING ON? 2 A I WOULD SAY FOUR OR FIVE INCHES. 3 THE COURT: PARDON ME. DID YOU INCLUDE THAT FOUR OR 4 FIVE INCHES IN HIS HEIGHT WHEN YOU GAVE AN ESTIMATE OF SIX-5 FOOT-FIVE? 6 THE WITNESS: NO. 7 THE COURT: YOU GAVE AN ESTIMATE OF HOW TALL HE ACTUALLY 8 WAS? 9 THE WITNESS: YES. 10 THE COURT: GO AHEAD. 11 Q BY MR. BARENS: THE FACT THAT AT ONE TIME YOU FELT 12 THAT THIS MAN -- I THINK MR. WAPNER POINTED OUT FOR US THAT 13 YOU MIGHT HAVE DESCRIBED ON A PRIOR OCCASION THAT THIS MAN 14 WAS SIX FEET TALL, BUT NOW I BELIEVE TODAY YOU SAID THAT YOU 15 THOUGHT THIS MAN COULD HAVE BEEN SIX-FOOT-FIVE, DO YOU HAVE 16 ANY EXPLANATION AS TO HOW YOU COULD HAVE VARIED THOSE 17 IDENTIFICATIONS? 18 A BASICALLY BECAUSE I SAID AT THE TIME -- I ALSO 19 SAID THAT THE GUY WE SAW WAS FIVE-FOOT-TEN. SO I WAS GOING 20 BY THAT HE WAS TALLER THAN THE MAN WE SAW. THAT IS BASICALLY 21 WHAT I WAS SAYING. SO --22 Q DID YOU PAY ANY PARTICULAR ATTENTION TO HIS HEIGHT? 23 DID YOU TRY TO ESTIMATE HIS HEIGHT WHEN YOU LOOKED AT HIM? 24 25 А NO. DID YOU PAY ANY PARTICULAR ATTENTION TO THE BUILD 26 Q 27 OF THE OTHER MAN? A NOT REALLY, JUST KIND OF LIKE A QUICK GLANCE OR 28

-3:

1	SOMETHING.
2	Q DID YOU PAY ANY ATTENTION TO WHETHER HE HAD A PAUNCH
3	OR NOT?
4	A NO.
5	Q IS THAT BECAUSE YOU WERE PRIMARILY PAYING ATTENTION
6	TO THE SILVER-HAIRED MAN?
7	MR. WAPNER: OBJECTION, LEADING.
8	THE WITNESS: YES.
9	THE COURT: I WILL LET IT STAND.
10	' Q BY MR. BARENS: DOES THE FACT THAT YOU SEEM UNABLE
11	TO REMEMBER SOME OF THE DETAILS THAT YOU HAVE BEEN ASKED ABOUT,
12	MAKE YOU ANY LESS CERTAIN OF THE IDENTIFICATION YOU MADE TO
13	THE POLICE FROM THE PHOTOS YOU WERE SHOWN?
14	A NO.
15	Q YOU MENTIONED THAT WHEN YOU SAW THE POLICE PHOTO
16	IN CONJUNCTION WITH A MOMENT, YOUR HONOR.
17	(PAUSE.)
18	Q BY MR. BARENS: I BELIEVE THAT YOU MENTIONED WHEN
19	YOU SAW THE POLICE PHOTO OF WHICH PEOPLE'S 6 IS AN ENLARGEMENT,
20	WE HAVE AGREED, IN CONJUNCTION WITH THE COLOR PHOTOGRAPH
21	REPRESENTING PEOPLE'S 154, THAT YOU BECAME 95 PERCENT SURE
22	THAT THIS IS THE MAN THAT YOU SAW IN THE GAS STATION?
23	A YES.
24	Q DOES THE FACT THAT YOU CAN'T REMEMBER EVERY DETAIL
25	OF THE ENVIRONMENT IN THE GAS STATION IN ANY WAY, MAKE YOU
26	LESS CERTAIN THAT THIS IS 95 PERCENT MOST LIKELY THE MAN THAT
27	YOU SAW IN THE GAS STATION?
28	A NO.

Г

WHEN YOU WERE INTERVIEWED BY MR. WAPNER AND THE Q 1 OTHER PEOPLE ASSOCIATED WITH MR. WAPNER ON THAT OCCASION, DID 2 YOU MENTION TO ANYONE THAT YOU HAD SEEN THE MAN STOPPED AT 3 THE SODA MACHINE ON THE WAY BACK TO HIS VEHICLE? 4 А NO. I BELIEVE NOT. 5 Q WHY IS THAT? 6 BECAUSE I DIDN'T RECOLLECT IT UNTIL AFTER I STARTED А 7 GOING OVER IT. THEN I REMEMBERED CERTAIN DETAILS THAT HAD 8 SLIPPED MY MIND THAT DAY. 9 ALL RIGHT. YOU HAVE THOUGHT ABOUT THIS INCIDENT 0 10 MORE EXTENSIVELY SINCE THEN UNTIL NOW THAN YOU DID IN THE 11 ONE DAY BETWEEN THE TIME THAT YOU SAW THE MAN AND WENT TO THE 12 POLICE? 13 А YES. 14 AND YOU HAVE THOUGHT MUCH MORE ABOUT TRYING TO Q 15 RECALL ALL OF THE DETAILS BETWEEN NOW AND THE TIME THAT YOU 16 WERE INTERVIEWED BY THE POLICE? 17 А YES. 18 WHEN YOU ESTIMATE THAT YOU WERE IN THE GAS STATION 19 Q A TOTAL OF 20 MINUTES, IS THAT THE SAME ESTIMATE YOU GAVE WHEN 20 YOU WERE INTERVIEWED BY THE POLICE AND MR. WAPNER? 21 22 А YES. I BELIEVE SO. 23 24 25 26 27 28

....

1	Q WHEN YOU MADE YOUR IDENTIFICATION OUT OF THE
2	POLICE PHOTO LINEUP CARD, DID YOU DO THAT TOTALLY INDEPENDENT
3	FROM CARMEN?
4	A YES.
5	Q WAS SHE AT ALL PRESENT AT ANY TIME IN THE ROOM
6	WITH YOU WHEN YOU MADE THAT PHOTO IDENTIFICATION?
7	A NO, SHE WAS NOT.
8	Q WHEN YOU WERE AT MY OFFICE, IT WAS A WEEK AGO
9	YESTERDAY; IS THAT CORRECT?
10	· A YES.
11	Q AND THAT IS THE FIRST TIME YOU AND I HAD EVER
12	SPOKEN?
13	A YES.
14	Q WHEN I COMMENCED TO SHOW YOU THE PHOTOGRAPH,
15	DID I TELL YOU THAT I WAS NOT SUGGESTING ANYTHING TO YOU
16	BY THE FACT THAT I WAS SHOWING YOU ANY PHOTOGRAPHS?
17	A YES.
18	Q DID I TELL YOU THAT THERE WAS NO REASON TO BELIEVE
19	THAT ONE PHOTOGRAPH WAS THE SAME AS ANY OF THE OTHER PHOTO-
20	GRAPHS AS FAR AS THE PERSON IN THE PHOTOGRAPHS?
21	A YES.
22	Q WHEN CARMEN SAW THIS PHOTOGRAPH, WAS IT FIRST
23	LAYING ON MY DESK?
24	A YES, IT WAS.
25	MR. WAPNER: THAT IS 153 FOR IDENTIFICATION?
26	THE COURT: YES.
27	Q BY MR. BARENS: DID SHE START TO CRY?
28	A EXCUSE ME?

1 Q DID SHE START TO CRY? 2 А DID I START TO CRY? 3 Q NO, NO. 4 DID CARMEN START TO CRY WHEN SHE SAW THIS PHOTO-5 GRAPH LAYING ON THE TABLE, ACTUALLY? 6 I CAN'T REMEMBER. А 7 DID YOU EVER MEET A DISTRICT ATTORNEY OR SOMEONE Q 8 FROM THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY'S OFFICE BY THE NAME OF LISA HART? 9 А YEAH, I BELIEVE SHE WAS THE ONE THAT CAME TO 10 RIO RICO. 11 Q WHERE DID YOU MEET HER? 12 AT RIO RICO. А 13 Q THAT IS WHERE CARMEN'S PARENTS LIVE? 14 YES. А 15 WAS THAT THE SAME DAY YOU MET WITH THE MAN WITH 0 16 THE IDENTI KIT? 17 А YES. 18 0 DO YOU REMEMBER THE DATE THAT THIS WAS OF THE 19 MONTH? 20 А THE 26TH, NOVEMBER 26. 21 WHY IS IT YOU REMEMBER THAT DAY? Q 22 THAT IS CARMEN'S BROTHER'S BIRTHDAY. А 23 NOW, WHEN YOU MET LISA HART, WAS SHE CONDUCTING Q 24 THE IDENTI KIT PORTION OF THE DISCUSSION? 25 А NO. 26 Q DID SHE HAVE ANYTHING TO DO WITH THE IDENTI KIT? 27 А NO. 28 Q DID SHE SEEM FAMILIAR WITH HOW TO DO AN IDENTI

1	KIT?	
2	А	NO, NOT AT ALL.
3		SHE WASN'T EVEN PRESENT IN THE ROOM.
4	Q	WITH THE IDENTI KIT?
5	А	WITH THE IDENTI KIT.
6	Q	DID SHE EVER TELL YOU WHY SHE WAS THERE?
7	А	NO.
8	Q	DID SHE TELL YOU SHE WAS NOT SUPPOSED TO TALK
9	TO YOU?	
10	А	YES.
11	Q	DID SHE TALK TO YOU?
12	А	YES.
13	Q	DID YOU TELL HER YOU WANTED TO TALK TO HER?
14	А	NO.
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

1 Q WAS THERE ANY THIRD PERSON PRESENT IN THE ROOM 2 WHILE SHE SPOKE TO YOU? 3 А YES, THERE WAS A -- YES, THERE WAS A TONY BRUIN. 4 Q WHO IS TONY BRUIN? 5 А ROGER'S FRIEND, OR ROGER'S ROOMMATE RIGHT NOW. 6 Q ROGER IS THE BROTHER OF CARMEN CANCHOLA? 7 А YES, HE WAS HAVING A BIRTHDAY. 8 Q DO YOU KNOW WHAT MR. BRUIN DOES FOR A LIVING? 9 А YES. HE IS GOING TO BECOME A POLICE OFFICER 10 SO HE IS WORKING WITH THE DPS. 11 Q WHAT DID LISA HART TELL YOU? 12 А BASICALLY, SHE SAID THAT SHE FELT WE WERE WASTING 13 HER TIME. THAT WE WERE WASTING THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY'S TIME 14 BY DOING THIS AND THAT WE -- BASICALLY, WE SHOULDN'T DO IT. 15 I MEAN THAT WAS THE GIST THAT I GOT FROM HER 16 WHEN SHE WAS TALKING. 17 SHE SAID A LOT OF STUFF. I MEAN SHE JUST RAMBLED 18 ON. 19 Q DO YOU REMEMBER ANY SPECIFIC WORDS THAT SHE SPOKE 20 OR PHRASES? 21 THAT -- SHE SAID SOMETHING LIKE THE FACT THAT Δ 22 WE IDENTIFIED THIS PERSON WAS LIKE A ONE IN A MILLION SHOT 23 SO THEY REALLY, YOU KNOW, WEREN'T PAYING THAT MUCH ATTENTION. 24 THAT THEY WERE JUST DOING THIS BECAUSE IF SOMEBODY CALLS 25 UP, THEY JUST HAVE TO CHECK OUT THE STORY. THAT IS WHAT 26 SHE SAID. 27 DID SHE SAY ANYTHING ELSE THAT YOU RECALL? Q 28 A NOT THAT I RECALL RIGHT NOW.

1	Q	DID SHE CONTINUE SPEAKING TO YOU?
2	А	THE WHOLE TIME THAT WE WERE SITTING BY HER, SHE
3	WAS TALKING.	
4	Q	HOW LONG DID THAT GO ON FOR, SIR?
5	А	BASICALLY THE LENGTH OF CARMEN'S INTERVIEW, I
6	THINK ABOUT	AN HOUR AND A HALF OR SO OR AN HOUR.
7	Q	WERE YOU SAYING THINGS TO HER?
8	А	NO.
9		SHE WAS DOING ALL THE TALKING.
10	Q	AFTER A WHILE, WERE YOU PAYING ATTENTION TO WHAT
11	SHE WAS SAYI	NG?
12	А	NO. THAT IS
13		I JUST KIND OF TUNED HER OUT.
14	Q	YOU MENTIONED THIS MORNING THAT YOU ARE NOT
15	PARTICULARL	GOOD AT ESTIMATING TIME.
16		IS THE ESTIMATE THAT YOU GAVE THAT YOU WERE 20
17	MINUTES IN T	THE GAS STATION, YOUR BEST ESTIMATE?
18	А	YES, THAT IS THE BEST ESTIMATE.
19	Q	BY THE WAY, ARE YOU A PHOTOGRAPHY STUDENT?
20	А	YES, I AM RIGHT NOW.
21	Q	IS THERE LIKE A TYPE OF PHOTOGRAPHY YOU ARE
22	INTERESTED	[N ?
23	А	I AM JUST BASICALLY RIGHT WE ARE JUST LEARNING
24	HOW TO DEVEL	LOP AND HOW TO TAKE PICTURES.
25	Q	YOU SAID YOU WERE PAYING PARTICULAR ATTENTION
26	TO THE SILVE	ER-HAIRED MAN BECAUSE HE STOOD OUT PARTICULARLY
27	IN THAT AREA	A AND THEN YOU SAID SOME DIALOGUE "BECAUSE HE
28	WAS OLDER."	

MY QUESTION IS: DID YOU ONLY NOTICE HIM BECAUSE HE WAS AN OLDER PERSON IN THAT LOCATION OR WAS THERE SOME-THING ELSE DISTINCTIVE ABOUT HIM? A NO, HE JUST STOOD OUT. I MEAN HIS WHOLE -- HIS WHOLE PERSON STOOD OUT. HE WAS A VERY DISTINCTIVE PERSON. I MEAN, HE JUST STOOD OUT IN FRONT OF THE CROWD. I GUESS IF HE WAS IN A CROWD, HE WOULD PROBABLY STAND OUT, TOO. Q DID THE TWO OR THREE GLASSES OF WINE AFFECT YOUR PERCEPTION? A NO, NOT AT ALL.

HAS DRINKING TWO OR THREE GLASSES OF WINE EVER Q 1 AFFECTED YOUR PERCEPTION? 2 А NO. 3 Q HOW MUCH DO YOU WEIGH, SIR? 4 А ABOUT 210 NOW. 5 0 COULD YOU ESTIMATE FOR ME, THE TOTAL TIME THAT 6 ELAPSED FROM THE TIME THAT YOU SAW CARMEN'S PARENTS WALK INTO 7 THE RESTAURANT AND PROCEED TO HAVE COFFEE WITH THEM AND THE 8 TIME THAT YOU EVENTUALLY GOT TO THE GAS STATION, WHERE YOU 9 SAW THE SILVER-HAIRED MAN? WHAT WOULD BE YOUR ESTIMATE? 10 А ABOUT AN HOUR AND A HALF TO TWO HOURS. 11 Q DO YOU KNOW A LOT ABOUT CARS? 12 А NO. 13 Q DID YOU TELL THE POLICE THAT IN NOVEMBER. THAT 14 YOU DIDN'T KNOW A LOT ABOUT CARS WHEN YOU WERE ASKED TO 15 IDENTIFY THE CAR THAT YOU SAW IN THE GAS STATION? 16 YES. 17 А Q DID YOU EVER SEE A PICTURE FROM THE POLICE OF THE 18 19 CAR THAT YOU SAW IN THE GAS STATION? А NO. 20 NOW, WHEN IT CAME TIME FOR THE IDENTI KIT, WERE 21 Q 22 YOU AND CARMEN IN A HURRY? 23 А YES WE WERE. 24 Q WHY? 25 А BECAUSE THERE WERE GUESTS. THERE WERE GUESTS 26 WAITING THERE FOR THE PARTY TO BEGIN. 27 WE WERE GOING TO HAVE A LITTLE BIRTHDAY CELEBRATION. THERE WERE THESE TWO DETECTIVES THERE WAITING 28

FOR US. SO UNTIL WE GOT THROUGH WITH THEM, THE PARTY 1 COULDN'T GET GOING. 2 Q SO, YOU WERE ACTUALLY INVOLVED IN THE IDENTI KIT 3 ACTIVITY AND YOU WERE TRYING TO RUSH THE MAN ALONG WHO WAS 4 DOING THAT WITH YOU? 5 А YES I WAS. 6 WERE YOU TRYING TO GET RID OF HIM? Q 7 А YES, DEFINITELY. 8 WHEN YOU GOT TO THE COMPOSITE THAT WAS SHOWN TO Q 9 YOU EARLIER TODAY, DID YOU EVER SAY THAT IT WAS A PICTURE OF 10 THE MAN YOU SAW IN THE GAS STATION? 11 А NO. 12 WOULD YOU, HAD YOU BEEN SHOWN THAT PHOTOGRAPH --Q 13 STRIKE THAT. 14 MR. WAPNER: OBJECTION, CALLING FOR SPECULATION WHAT 15 HE WOULD HAVE DONE. 16 THE COURT: YOU MEAN THE COMPOSITE? YOU DON'T MEAN THE 17 PHOTOGRAPH. 18 MR. BARENS: I STARTED TO CORRECT MYSELF. I THOUGHT 19 MR. WAPNER WAS GOING TO CORRECT ME, TOO. 20 21 MR. WAPNER: WELL, SAME OBJECTION, CALLING FOR SPECULATION AS TO WHAT HE WOULD HAVE DONE HAD SOMETHING 22 23 HAPPENED. MR. BARENS: YES. I CAN BRING IT MORE CURRENT, JUDGE. 24 25 THE COURT: FINE. 26 MR. BARENS: JUST A MOMENT. 27 (PAUSE.) 28 BY MR. BARENS: LET ME BACK UP FOR JUST A MOMENT. Q

-2 :

.

1	WHEN YOU WERE IN THE GAS STATION WITH CARMEN, WERE YOU UNDER
2	ANY STRESS WHEN YOU SAW THIS SILVER-HAIRED MAN?
3	A NO I WAS NOT.
4	Q WHEN YOU SAW THE SILVER-HAIRED MAN, DID YOU KNOW
5	THAT YOU WOULD EVER HAVE TO COME TO COURT TO IDENTIFY HIM?
6	A NO, NOT AT ALL.
7	Q DID YOU INDICATE TO THE OFFICER AT THE TIME, THAT
8	THE IDENTI KIT HAD FAILED TO PRODUCE A REPRESENTATION OF THE
9	PERSON THAT YOU SAW IN THE GAS STATION?
10	A YES. AND I BELIEVE HE SAID, "YEAH. THESE THINGS
11	ARE VERY LIMITED TO WHAT YOU CAN DO WITH THEM." SO
12	Q WAS IT THE DISCUSSION THAT YOU HAD WITH CARMEN,
13	THAT MADE YOU FEEL THE SILVER-HAIRED MAN WAS GAY OR OBSERVATIONS
14	YOU MADE INDEPENDENT OF YOUR DISCUSSION WITH CARMEN?
15	A YES. IT WAS I HAD THE GIST OF IT BEFORE I
16	TALKED TO HER, THAT THE MAN WAS GAY.
17	Q YOU MEAN YOU HAD THE SENSE, WHEN YOU SAY THE GIST?
18	A THE SENSE, YES.
19	Q HOW FAR IS TUCSON FROM THE MEXICAN BORDER?
20	A SIXTY MILES.
21	Q IT TAKES ABOUT AN HOUR TO DRIVE THERE?
22	A YES.
23	Q WHEN YOU SPOKE TO CARMEN AFTER YOU LEFT THE POLICE
24	STATION ON NOVEMBER 22, YOU HAD BOTH MADE YOUR PICKS AS FAR
25	AS WHO YOU SELECTED IN THE PHOTOGRAPHIC LINEUPS BEFORE YOU
26	LEFT THE STATION? IS THAT TRUE?
27	A YES.
28	Q YOU DIDN'T KNOW WHO SHE PICKED, DID YOU?

1	A NO.
2	Q SHE DIDN'T KNOW WHO YOU PICKED, DID SHE?
3	A NO.
4	Q BEFORE YOU LEFT THE STATION, DID YOU KNOW WHETHER
5	OR NOT SHE HAD EVEN PICKED ANYONE?
6	A NO.
7	Q DID SHE KNOW WHETHER IN FACT, YOU HAD PICKED ANYONE
8	A NO.
9	Q BEFORE YOU WENT TO THE STATION, DID YOU GUYS
10	DISCUSS THE IDENTIFYING FEATURES OF THE MAN ON THE WAY TO THE
11	STATION?
12	A NO.
13	Q DID YOU BELIEVE THAT THE PERSON YOU PICKED FROM
14	THE POLICE PHOTOGRAPHIC LINEUP, WAS THE PERSON THAT YOU SAW
15	IN THE GAS STATION, IRRESPECTIVE OF WHO CARMEN PICKED?
16	A COULD YOU REPEAT THAT? SORRY.
17	Q DID YOU BELIEVE THAT THE PERSON YOU SAW AT THE
18	GAS STATION, WAS THE PERSON THAT YOU SAW AT THE GAS STATION,
19	NO MATTER WHO CARMEN PICKED OUT OF THE PHOTOGRAPHIC LINEUP?
20	A YES.
21	Q SO, YOUR BELIEF THAT YOU ARE CORRECT, DOESN'T
22	DEPEND UPON WHO SHE PICKED OUT OR DIDN'T PICK?
23	A RIGHT.
24	MR. WAPNER: OBJECTION, ARGUMENTATIVE.
25	THE COURT: SUSTAINED. YOU CAN ARGUE THAT.
26	MR. WAPNER: MOTION TO STRIKE THE ANSWER.
27	THE COURT: SUSTAINED.
28	Q BY MR. BARENS: WHEN YOU FIRST LEFT FOR THE GAS

ſ

.

1	STATION STRIKE THAT.
2	WHEN YOU FIRST LEFT FOR THE POLICE STATION WITH
3	CARMEN ON NOVEMBER 22, DID SHE TELL YOU WHY YOU WERE GOING
4	TO THE POLICE STATION?
5	A YES.
6	Q DID SHE TELL YOU, "LET'S TRY TO PICK SOMEBODY OUT
7	WHEN WE GET THERE"?
8	A NO.
9	MR. BARENS: THANK YOU, SIR.
10	
11	RECROSS-EXAMINATION
12	BY MR. WAPNER:
13	Q MR. LOPEZ, DIDN'T YOU SPEND ALMOST 45 MINUTES WITH
14	DETECTIVE EDHOLM DOING THE IDENTI KIT COMPOSITES?
15	A YES. I BELIEVE SO.
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
1	

1	Q AND DIDN'T CARMEN SPEND ALMOST ANOTHER HOUR WITH
2	HIM?
3	A YES.
4	Q AT THE TIME
5	WELL, WHEN LISA HART FIRST SPOKE TO YOU, DID
6	SHE GIVE YOU HER BUSINESS CARD?
7	A I DON'T REMEMBER.
8	Q DID YOU UNDERSTAND THAT SHE WAS A DEPUTY DISTRICT
9	ATTORNEY, THAT SHE WAS A LAWYER?
10	A YES.
11	Q SHE NEVER TOLD YOU SHE WAS ANYTHING OTHER THAN
12	A LAWYER, DID SHE?
13	A SHE SAID SHE WAS WORKING FOR YOU.
14	Q WORKED IN THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY'S OFFICE?
15	A RIGHT.
16	Q AND YOU KNEW WHEN I TALKED TO YOU THAT I WAS
17	A LAWYER, RIGHT?
18	A YES.
19	Q WELL, WHEN SHE FIRST WAS AT YOUR HOUSE EXCUSE
20	ME AT CARMEN'S PARENTS' HOUSE IN RIO RICO, SHE TOLD YOU
21	THAT SHE COULDN'T TALK TO YOU ABOUT THE CASE, RIGHT?
22	A RIGHT.
23	Q AND AT THE TIME THAT SHE TOLD YOU THAT, WAS TONY
24	BRUIN IN THE ROOM?
25	A NO.
26	THAT IS WHEN THEY MET US AT THE DOOR, SHE TOLD
27	US THAT SHE COULDN'T TALK ABOUT THE CASE.
28	Q AND THAT THE ONLY PURPOSE OF BEING THERE WAS

s.

1 TO HAVE THE IDENTI KIT DONE? 2 А RIGHT. 3 WHEN SHE WAS IN THE ROOM TALKING TO YOU, THAT Q 4 IS BECAUSE MR. EDHOLM WAS TRYING TO DO THE IDENTI KIT WITH 5 CARMEN? 6 А RIGHT. 7 WAS MR. BRUIN THERE FOR THE PARTY OR DID HE COME 0 8 WITH SOME OF THE TUCSON POLICE OFFICERS? 9 NO: А 10 HE WAS THERE WITH -- HE WAS THERE FOR THE PARTY. 11 Q WASN'T HE IN FACT AN EXPLORER SCOUT WITH THE 12 TUCSON POLICE DEPARTMENT? 13 А HE IS WORKING FOR DPS, I BELIEVE. 14 0 WHICH IS THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC --15 А DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SAFETY. 16 0 IS THAT A PART OF THE POLICE DEPARTMENT? 17 А YES. 18 SO HE IS PRETTY INTERESTED IN BECOMING A POLICE Q 19 OFFICER? 20 А RIGHT. 21 IN FACT, WASN'T MISS HART TALKING -- WASN'T HE Q 22 ASKING MISS HART ABOUT HER EXPERIENCES IN LAW ENFORCEMENT? 23 I GUESS. I DON'T KNOW. А 24 AND DIDN'T SHE SPEND MOST OF THE TIME THAT YOU 0 25 AND MR. BRUIN AND SHE WERE IN THE ROOM TOGETHER, TALKING 26 ABOUT CASES SHE HAD HANDLED AND ANSWERING QUESTIONS HE WAS 27 ASKING HER? 28 А NO, ACTUALLY SHE STARTED TALKING ABOUT THIS CASE

1	FIRST AND THEN SHE STARTED TALKING ABOUT SOMETHING ELSE.
2	I DON'T KNOW. I TUNED HER OUT AFTER A WHILE.
3	Q WHEN YOU TUNED HER OUT, WASN'T SHE TALKING TO
4	MR. BRUIN?
5	A YES.
6	MR. BARENS: OBJECTION. HOW WOULD HE KNOW, IF HE TUNED
7	HER OUT?
8	THE COURT: HE ANSWERED. OVERRULED.
9	Q BY MR. WAPNER: WAS SHE TALKING TO MR. BRUIN?
10	A. I GUESS. I DON'T KNOW.
11	Q DID THAT COMPRISE MOST OF THE TIME THAT SHE SPENT
12	WHILE CARMEN WAS DOING THE IDENTI KIT WITH MR. EDHOLM?
13	A I'GUESS.
14	I TUNED HER OUT AFTER A WHILE, I DON'T KNOW WHAT
15	SHE SAID AFTER THAT. SHE WAS JUST RAMBLING ON.
16	Q WHAT DID SHE SAY TO YOU SPECIFICALLY THAT YOU
17	CAN REMEMBER?
18	A JUST WHAT I GOT FROM IT WAS THAT SHE SHE JUST
19	BASICALLY DIDN'T BELIEVE US REALLY, THAT WE SAW THIS GUY
20	OR THAT THIS WAS JUST KIND OF LIKE A WASTE OF HER TIME OR
21	A WASTE OF YOUR TIME OR WHOSEVER'S TIME IT WAS, TO GO UP
22	THERE TO TUCSON TO DO THIS.
23	Q DID YOU FEEL INTIMIDATED?
24	A I WAS MORE MAD AT THE FACT THAT SHE WAS SAYING
25	THIS STUFF.
26	Q WHAT WAS IT THAT MADE YOU MAD?
27	A THE FACT THAT SHE WAS SAYING SHE DIDN'T BELIEVE
28	US, THAT REALLY ANNOYED ME.

- 3

ſ

1	Q WHAT DID SHE SAY SPECIFICALLY?
2	A I CAN'T REMEMBER. I JUST KIND OF LIKE GOT A
3	GENERAL IDEA OF WHAT SHE SAID.
4	Q BY THE WAY, DID CARMEN WAS CARMEN ATTENDING
5	THE UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA AT THAT TIME?
6	A I AM NOT NO, I DON'T THINK SO.
7	I THINK SHE WAS GOING TO PIMA COLLEGE.
8	THE COURT REPORTER: IS THAT P-I-M-A?
9	THE WITNESS: I GUESS.
10	YES, SHE HAS.
11	Q BY MR. WAPNER: WHEN YOU GOT SODAS OUT OF THIS
12	MACHINE AT THE GAS STATION, WHERE DID YOU STAND?
13	A I DON'T KNOW. I DON'T KNOW. YOU SEE RIGHT ABOVE
14	IT, I GUESS IT OPENS THIS WAY SO I GUESS IT IS ONE OF THOSE
15	THAT JUST SLIDES OPEN AND YOU STICK YOUR HAND IN THERE AND
16	YOU GRAB THE SODA.
17	Q TAKE A LOOK AT THIS PICTURE THAT IS 233 FOR
18	IDENTIFICATION; DOES THAT ACCURATELY DEPICT THE SODA MACHINE
19	THE WAY IT LOOKED THAT DAY?
20	A I GUESS. IT IS HARD TO SEE WITH THAT SHADOW
21	ON THERE.
22	MR. BARENS: I AM NOT SURE THE ANSWER IS RESPONSIVE.
23	HE SAID "I GUESS, IT IS HARD TO SEE".
24	THE WITNESS: I AM NOT THERE IS A SHADOW ON THE
25	MACHINE, YOU CAN'T TELL.
26	Q BY MR. WAPNER: CAN YOU SEE THE MACHINE IN THAT
27	PICTURE?
28	A YES, YOU CAN MAKE IT OUT.
ł	

WHAT I AM INTERESTED IN, IS THE CURBING AROUND 0 1 THE MACHINE. AS FAR AS THE WIDTH OF THE MACHINE AND THE WIDTH 2 OF THE ISLAND, DOESN'T THE MACHINE TAKE UP THE WHOLE WIDTH 3 OF THE ISLAND? LOOK AT THAT PICTURE. SEE IF IT DOESN'T APPEAR 4 THAT IT TAKES UP THE WHOLE WIDTH OF THE ISLAND. 5 YOU CAN'T TELL FROM LOOKING AT THIS. А 6 YOU CAN'T TELL FROM LOOKING AT THE PICTURE? 0 7 А YOU CAN SEE THAT THE CURB IS BLACK AND THE SHADOW 8 IS BLACK, SO YOU CAN'T REALLY TELL. 9 0 AND DOES IT APPEAR THAT YOU GET THE SODAS BY GOING 10 IN ON THE EASTSIDE OR CAN YOU GET THEM FROM BOTH SIDES? 11 А I THINK YOU CAN GET THEM FROM BOTH SIDES. 12 WHEN YOU TALKED TO DETECTIVE EDMONDS AT THE HIGH 0 13 SCHOOL GYM PARKING LOT, DO YOU REMEMBER COMPARING HIS 14 PHYSIQUE TO THE -- BEING ASKED TO COMPARE SERGEANT EDMONDS' 15 PHYSIQUE TO THE PERSON YOU SAW IN THE GAS STATION? 16 MR. BARENS: ASKED AND ANSWERED. 17 THE WITNESS: NO. I DON'T REMEMBER. 18 - Q BY MR. WAPNER: DO YOU REMEMBER COMPARING SERGEANT 19 EDMONDS' PHYSIQUE TO THE PERSON YOU SAW IN THE GAS STATION? 20 NO. THE ONLY THING I REMEMBER IS WHEN THEY ASKED А 21 22 ME ABOUT THEIR AGE. 23 0 WHAT ABOUT ASKING YOU ABOUT WHETHER THE PERSON WORKED OUT? 24 25 NO. I DON'T REMEMBER. THEY ASKED ME WHAT I THOUGHT А THEIR AGE WAS. THAT IS WHAT THEY ASKED ME. 26 27 Q I WANT TO SHOW YOU WHAT APPEARS TO BE A TRANSCRIPT 28 OF A PORTION OF A TAPE RECORDING OF AN INTERVIEW THAT THEY

- 1

1 DID WITH YOU. IT STARTS OVER ON THE PREVIOUS PAGE, WOULD 2 YOU JUST TAKE A LOOK AT THAT AND THE NEXT PAGE? 3 А (THE WITNESS COMPLIES.) 4 Q DOES THAT REFRESH YOUR RECOLLECTION AS TO WHETHER 5 YOU TALKED TO DETECTIVE EDMONDS ABOUT WHETHER THE PERSON YOU 6 SAW IN THE GAS STATION -- HOW THE PERSON WAS BUILT? 7 А NOT REALLY. 8 Q YOU DON'T REMEMBER SAYING TO HIM ABOUT HOW THE 9 PERSON WAS BUILT? 10 A NO. ACTUALLY, I WAS KIND OF PISSED OFF BECAUSE 11 THEY CAME AND TOOK ME OUT OF A WRESTLING CLASS. 12 Q SO YOU DON'T RECALL MAKING ANY STATEMENTS ON THE 13 APPARENT TRANSCRIPTION? 14 A I MIGHT HAVE SAID IT. I DON'T KNOW. I DON'T 15 REMEMBER. 16 THE COURT: EVEN AFTER READING IT, YOU DON'T REMEMBER? 17 THE WITNESS: YES. 18 THE COURT: READ IT TO HIM. 19 MR. BARENS: EXCUSE ME, YOUR HONOR. IF HE SAID THAT 20 IT DOESN'T REFRESH HIS RECOLLECTION, HOW DOES IT GET IN OTHER 21 THAN BY JUDICIAL FIAT? 22 THE COURT: HE HAS A RIGHT TO ASK HIM WHETHER OR NOT 23 HE DIDN'T MAKE THE FOLLOWING STATEMENTS. 24 MR. BARENS: NOT IF HE DOESN'T REMEMBER. 25 THE COURT: YOU GO AHEAD AND ASK HIM THAT, WILL YOU? 26 MR. BARENS: WE OBJECT TO THAT AND --27 THE COURT: THE OBJECTION IS OVERRULED. THAT IS THE 28 PROPER WAY OF DOING IT.

- 2

1	DO YOU WANT TO ASK HIM?
2	MR. WAPNER: YES.
3	Q MR. LOPEZ, DO YOU REMEMBER TELLING DETECTIVE
4	EDMONDS THAT THE PERSON THAT YOU SAW IN THE GAS STATION WAS
5	WELL BUILT?
6	A NO. I DON'T REMEMBER.
7	Q DO YOU REMEMBER TELLING HIM THAT HE WORKED OUT?
8	A WHO WORKED OUT?
9	Q THAT THE PERSON YOU SAW IN THE GAS STATION WORKED
10	OUT, LOOKED LIKE HE WORKED OUT?
11	A I DON'T REMEMBER.
12	Q AND DO YOU REMEMBER DETECTIVE EDMONDS ASKING YOU
13	WHETHER THE PERSON WAS BUILT LIKE HE WAS AND YOU SAYING THAT
14	HE HAD MORE DEFINITION, THAT IS, MORE DEFINITION THAN
15	DETECTIVE EDMONDS?
16	A NO. I DON'T REMEMBER THAT EITHER.
17	MR. WAPNER: THANK YOU. NOTHING FURTHER.
18	THE COURT: I THINK WE WILL TAKE A RECESS AT THIS TIME.
19	MR. BARENS: YOUR HONOR ALL RIGHT.
20	THE COURT: LADIES AND GENTLEMEN OF THE JURY, WE'LL TAKE
21	A RECESS AT THIS TIME UNTIL 1:45 THIS AFTERNOON.
22	THAT IS 1:45 THIS AFTERNOON. THE SAME ADMONITION
23	THAT I GAVE YOU STILL APPLIES. THANK YOU.
24	(AT 12:02 P.M. A RECESS WAS TAKEN UNTIL
25	1:30 P.M. OF THE SAME DAY.)
26	
27	
28	

;

SANTA MONICA, CALIFORNIA; MONDAY, APRIL 6, 1987; 1:50 P.M.
DEPARTMENT WEST C HON. LAURENCE J. RITTENBAND, JUDGE
(APPEARANCES AS NOTED ON TITLE PAGE.)
THE COURT: ARE YOU FINISHED WITH HIM?
MR. WAPNER: I JUST HAVE ONE OTHER QUESTION, MAYBE
TWO.
JESUS ADELBERTO LOPEZ,
THE WITNESS ON THE STAND AT THE TIME OF ADJOURNMENT, RESUMED
THE STAND AND TESTIFIED FURTHER AS FOLLOWS:
REDIRECT EXAMINATION (RESUMED)
BY MR. WAPNER:
Q DO YOU KNOW WHERE CARMEN WENT TO HIGH SCHOOL
WHEN SHE WAS IN ARIZONA?
A SAHUARITA.
Q WHICH IS WHERE?
A A COUPLE OF MILES OUT OF TUCSON.
Q WHAT IS THE NAME OF THE TOWN THAT IT IS IN?
A SAHUARITA.
THE COURT REPORTER: HOW DO YOU SPELL IT?
THE WITNESS: I DON'T KNOW. I DIDN'T GO TO SCHOOL
THERE.
MR. WAPNER: I HAVE NOTHING FURTHER.
MR. BARENS: I HAVE NO QUESTIONS, YOUR HONOR.
THE COURT: I HAVE JUST ONE.

Į

÷.

1	DID YOU KNOW WHY YOU WERE GOING THERE?
2	THE WITNESS: I I DIDN'T.
3	SHE DID.
4	THE COURT: DIDN'T SHE TELL YOU WHY SHE WANTED TO GO?
5	THE WITNESS: SHE JUST TOLD ME SHE WAS WE WERE
6	SUPPOSED TO MEET WITH SOME.
7	THE COURT: DID SHE TELL YOU ANYTHING MORE THAN THAT?
8	THE WITNESS: WELL, NOT REALLY, BECAUSE ALL SHE TOLD
9	ME WAS THAT THAT NIGHT, WE HAD A DATE AND REAL BRIEFLY,
10	SHE MENTIONED THAT SHE HAD GONE TO SEE THE POLICEMEN.
11	THE COURT: THAT SHE HAD ALREADY GONE TO SEE THEM?
12	THE WITNESS: YES.
13	AND THEN THE NEXT DAY
14	THE COURT: DID SHE TELL YOU WHY SHE WENT TO THE POLICE?
15	THE WITNESS: VERY BRIEFLY, PROBABLY.
16	I WASN'T LISTENING TO HER BECAUSE I DIDN'T KNOW
17	WE WERE GOING TO BE IN THIS AT ALL.
18	THE COURT: DID SHE TELL YOU SHE HAD READ THIS ARTICLE
19	IN ESQUIRE MAGAZINE AND SHE WAS VERY EXCITED ABOUT IT?
20	THE WITNESS: NO.
21	SHE JUST TOLD ME SHE HAD GONE TO THE POLICE.
22	THE COURT: DID SHE TELL YOU WHY?
23	THE WITNESS: AND THEY HAD TOLD HER THEY WANTED TO
24	TALK TO US LATER ON.
25	
26	
27	
28	

1	THE COURT: DID SHE TELL YOU WHY?
2	THE WITNESS: SHE MIGHT HAVE PROBABLY.
3	THE COURT: DID SHE TELL YOU ABOUT READING AN ARTICLE
4	IN ESQUIRE MAGAZINE?
5	THE WITNESS: THE NEXT DAY.
6	THE COURT: AND DID SHE SHOW YOU THE MAGAZINE?
7	THE WITNESS: NO. SHE DIDN'T HAVE IT WITH HER.
8	THE COURT: ALL RIGHT. OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
9	ANYTHING FURTHER?
10	MR. BARENS: NOTHING.
11	THE COURT: ANYTHING FURTHER?
12	MR. WAPNER: JUST A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS IN THAT SAME
13	VEIN.
14	
15	FURTHER RECROSS-EXAMINATION
16	BY MR. WAPNER:
17	Q WAS IT THURSDAY NIGHT THAT YOU SAY YOU HAD A DATE
18	WITH HER?
19	A RIGHT.
20	Q THAT WAS THURSDAY OR FRIDAY?
21	A NO. IT WAS A FRIDAY NIGHT.
22	
23	Q ALL RIGHT. SHE SAID THAT SHE HAD ALREADY GONE
20	TO THE POLICE?
24	
	TO THE POLICE?
24	TO THE POLICE? A YES. SHE HAD BEEN TO THE POLICE.
24 25	TO THE POLICE? A YES. SHE HAD BEEN TO THE POLICE. Q NOW, DID SHE SAY SHE HAD GONE TO THE POLICE THAT
24 25 26	TO THE POLICE? A YES. SHE HAD BEEN TO THE POLICE. Q NOW, DID SHE SAY SHE HAD GONE TO THE POLICE THAT DAY?

N*1.4

FROM DETECTIVE MEYERS TOMORROW. 1 Q BUT SHE DIDN'T SAY ANYTHING MORE THAN, "I JUST 2 WENT TO THE POLICE"? 3 А BASICALLY, YES. 4 0 DIDN'T YOU SAY, "WELL, WHAT WERE YOU DOING AT THE 5 POLICE STATION?" 6 MR. BARENS: ARGUMENTATIVE. 7 THE COURT: OVERRULED. GO AHEAD. 8 BY MR. WAPNER: DID YOU SAY, "WHY DID YOU GO TO Q 9 THE POLICE? WHAT DID YOU DO THERE?" 10 YES I DID. А 11 Q WHAT DID SHE SAY? 12 А SHE JUST SAID, "I WENT TO THE POLICE BECAUSE I 13 READ THIS ARTICLE. THAT'S IT." 14 I MEAN, WE DIDN'T GET INTO IT VERY INVOLVED BECAUSE 15 WE WERE ON A DATE. I LIKE TO DO MORE THINGS WITH MY TIME THAN 16 TALK ABOUT COURT. 17 18 Q I AM SURE YOU DO. BUT THE QUESTION IS, WHEN SHE TOLD YOU --19 A I JUST TOLD HER BASICALLY WHAT I SAID AND --20 LET ME FINISH MY QUESTION --21 Q BASICALLY WHAT I SAID WAS THAT WE WOULD TALK ABOUT 22 А 23 IT TOMORROW IF THEY CALL YOU, REALLY. 24 DID SHE SAY SHE HAD READ THE ARTICLE IN THE Q MAGAZINE AND DID SHE SAY ANYTHING ABOUT THE GUY THE TWO OF 25 26 YOU HAD SEEN AT THE GAS STATION? 27 SHE MIGHT HAVE, I GUESS. I DON'T REMEMBER. I А WAS PREOCCUPIED WITH SOMETHING ELSE, REALLY. 28

- ?

1	Q AND WHEN YOU WENT TO THE POLICE ON THE NEXT DAY,
2	ON SATURDAY, DID YOU KNOW WHAT IT WAS ABOUT THAT YOU WERE
3	BEING ASKED TO COME TO THE POLICE FOR?
4	A YES. ON THE WAY OVER THERE, YEAH.
5	Q AND THAT YOU KNEW IT WAS ABOUT SEEING THIS PERSON
6	IN THE GAS STATION?
7	A YES.
8	MR. WAPNER: OKAY. THANK YOU. NOTHING FURTHER.
9	THE COURT: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. YOU MAY
10	STEP DOWN.
11	MAY THE WITNESS BE EXCUSED?
12	MR. BARENS: YES, YOUR HONOR.
13	THE COURT: ALL RIGHT.
14	MR. BARENS: MAY WE HAVE A MOMENT WITH THE PEOPLE?
15	THE COURT: YES.
16	(PAUSE.)
17	MR. BARENS: COULD WE APPROACH BRIEFLY, YOUR HONOR?
18	THE COURT: ALL RIGHT.
19	(THE FOLLOWING PROCEEDINGS WERE HELD
20	AT THE BENCH:)
21	MR. BARENS: YOUR HONOR, I AM LOOKING TO HAVE MR. WAPNER
22	ENTER A STIPULATION WITH THE DEFENSE THAT AMONG THE PHONE
23	RECORDS WHICH ARE PEOPLE'S 68-A WELL, IT IS 68 AND A
24	VARIETY OF SUBLETTERS TO 68, THAT ARE TELEPHONE CALLS FROM
25	THE ROOM AT THE PLAZA HOTEL THAT MR. PITTMAN/GRAHAM HAD.
26	THERE ARE THREE PHONE CALLS TO HIS HOME PHONE
27	NUMBER AND TWO PHONE CALLS TO JOE HUNT'S HOME PHONE NUMBER.
28	AND I WOULD LIKE TO ENTER THEM. I HAVE THE PAGES CLIPPED.

IT IS KIND OF IMPORTANT TO -- MAY I JUST HAVE A MINUTE? BECAUSE MR. WAPNER HAS RIGHTFULLY SAID THAT HE DOESN'T WANT TO DO IT UNTIL HE CAN SEE IT WITH HIS OWN EYES AND VERIFY IT. I HAVE A LITTLE SUMMARY WITH THE PAGES CLIPPED AND I WOULD LIKE TO GO INTO THAT AT THIS JUNCTURE. :

F

MR. WAPNER: I AM NOT WILLING TO DO THAT NOW. 1 THE COURT: WHY PARTICULARLY NOW? YOU CAN ALWAYS POINT 2 3 OUT TO THE JURY WHEN YOU TALK ABOUT THESE TELEPHONE CALLS, YOU CAN SUBSTANTIATE IT BY REFERENCE TO THE EXHIBIT. 4 5 MR. BARENS: COULD WE RESERVE THAT FOR MR. WAPNER TO HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO DO THAT MAYBE THIS AFTERNOON OR 6 TOMORROW OR SOMETHING AND ENTER THE STIPULATION LATER? 7 THE COURT: I DON'T KNOW. WHAT IS THE SENSE OF IT? 8 WHY AT THIS PARTICULAR TIME? 9 10 MR. BARENS: IT WAS A DECISION I MADE, YOUR HONOR. THE COURT: HE DOESN'T WANT TO STIPULATE. I CAN'T 11 FORCE HIM TO. 12 13 MR. BARENS: NO, I WOULD NOT SUGGEST THAT. 14 WHAT I AM SUGGESTING, YOUR HONOR, IS I WOULD 15 LIKE TO RESERVE TO ENTER THE STIPULATION AT A TIME PRIOR 16 TO DELIBERATION. MR. WAPNER: I AM NOT EVEN TELLING HIM I AM GOING TO 17 18 DO IT UNTIL I SEE THE RECORDS AND SEE SOME VERIFICATION OF 19 IT. 20 MR. BARENS: WELL, IF HE WOULD JUST LOOK AT THE CLIPPED 21 PAGES NOW, THE PHONE NUMBERS ARE RIGHT ON THE RECORDS. I 22 AM NOT MAKING THIS UP. 23 MR. WAPNER: I AM NOT GOING TO DO THAT NOW. I AM NOT 24 GOING TO BE PUT IN THAT POSITION, YOUR HONOR. 25 THE COURT: IF HE DOESN'T WANT TO ENTER THE STIPULATION, 26 I AM NOT GOING TO FORCE HIM. 27 MR. BARENS: ALL RIGHT, YOUR HONOR. THANK YOU. 28 (THE FOLLOWING PROCEEDINGS WERE HELD IN

- 1

1	OPEN COURT IN THE PRESENCE AND HEARING
2	OF THE JURY:)
3	MR. BARENS: THE DEFENSE RESTS.
4	MR. WAPNER: I WILL HAVE REBUTTAL WITNESSES.
5	I WAS CAUGHT A LITTLE BIT SHORT, TO SAY THE LEAST.
6	THE COURT: ALL RIGHT. WHEN CAN YOU GET THEM IN?
7	MR. WAPNER: PROBABLY TOMORROW.
8	THE COURT: ALL RIGHT, I DON'T THINK THERE IS ANY
9	ALTERNATIVE BUT TO TAKE AN ADJOURNMENT. WHAT WE COULD DO
10	IS THIS AFTERNOON GO OVER THE PROPOSED INSTRUCTIONS WHICH
11	THE COURT WILL GIVE TO THE JURY AT THE CONCLUSION OF THE
12	CASE.
13	MR. BARENS: I HAVE NOT PREPARED THE INSTRUCTIONS, YOUR
14	HONOR, AS I DID NOT CONTEMPLATE THE NEED TO DO THAT UNTIL
15	WE HAD FINISHED THE TESTIMONY.
16	MR. WAPNER: I DIDN'T EITHER. AT THIS POINT, COUNSEL
17	IS IN A LOT BETTER POSITION TO CONTEMPLATE THAN I AM.
18	THE COURT: HAD YOU ADVISED COUNSEL OR THE COURT OF
19	THE FACT YOU WERE GOING TO REST WITHOUT ADDITIONAL TESTIMONY,
20	WE MIGHT HAVE MADE SOME ADDITIONAL ARRANGEMENTS. HOWEVER,
21	COUNSEL IS SURPRISED AT THIS PARTICULAR POINT. I THINK IF
22	HE WANTS ADDITIONAL TIME TO GET TESTIMONY, I THINK HE IS
23	ENTITLED TO THAT.
24	MR. BARENS: I HAVE NO DISAGREEMENT WITH THAT, YOUR
25	HONOR.
26	THE COURT: HOW LONG WILL IT TAKE YOU TO GET THAT?
27	MR. WAPNER: I THINK PROBABLY, ACTUALLY I THINK I CAN
28	HAVE SOME BY TOMORROW.
1	

- 2

ł

- 3

.

А

ſ

1	THE COURT: ALL RIGHT. THEN LADIES AND GENTLEMEN,
2	WE HAVE NO ALTERNATIVE BUT TO TAKE AN ADJOURNMENT AT THIS
3	TIME UNTIL TOMORROW MORNING AT THE CUSTOMARY TIME OF 10:30.
4	THE SAME ADMONITION WOULD STILL APPLY.
5	WILL YOU APPROACH THE BENCH? WE MIGHT BE ABLE
6	TO UTILIZE THE BALANCE OF TIME ON SOME OTHER MATTERS.
7	MR. WAPNER: THANK YOU.
8	(THE FOLLOWING PROCEEDINGS WERE HELD AT
9	THE BENCH OUTSIDE THE PRESENCE AND HEARING
10	OF THE JURY:) .
11	MR. WAPNER: I HAVE A LIST OF INSTRUCTIONS, THERE IS
12	ONE INSTRUCTION I WOULD LIKE TO DRAFT. IT HAS TO DO WITH
13	EYEWITNESS IDENTIFICATION AND I WOULD LIKE TO HAVE
14	THE COURT: ARE YOU GOING TO HAVE ANY IDENTIFICATION
15	EXPERT TESTIFY?
16	MR. WAPNER: NO, I DON'T THINK SO.
17	MR. BARENS: I AM SORRY?
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
1	

1	THE COURT: I THINK WE HAVE GOT A LOT OF NEW INSTRUCTIONS,
2	HAVEN'T WE, ON EYEWITNESS IDENTIFICATION AND TESTIMONY.
3	MR. WAPNER: YES.
4	THE COURT: WHAT IS IT YOU WANT TO ADDRESS?
5	MR. WAPNER: WELL, JUST INSTRUCTIONS ON EYEWITNESS
6	TESTIMONY, THAT HAS MOSTLY TO DO WITH THAT.
7	THE COURT: DEFENSE?
8	MR. WAPNER: RIGHT, DEFENSE WITNESSES AND THE PEOPLE'S
9	BURDEN OF PROOF AND PROVING IDENTITY BEYOND A REASONABLE
10	DOUBT.
11	THE COURT: THERE IS NOTHING ELSE WE CAN DO AT THIS
12	TIME, IS THERE?
13	MR. BARENS: WE ALSO HAVE SOME INSTRUCTIONS WE PROPOSE
14	TO DRAFT.
15	THE COURT: ALL RIGHT, FINE.
16	MR. WAPNER: YOUR HONOR, THE OTHER THING IS I CAN HAVE
17	REBUTTAL WITNESSES, THEY PROBABLY AREN'T GOING TO EVEN TAKE
18	THE WHOLE DAY TOMORROW.
19	THE COURT: DO YOU WANT ANY TIME TO PREPARE YOUR
20	ARGUMENT?
21	MR. WAPNER: YES.
22	MR. BARENS: QUITE SO, YOUR HONOR.
23	I HAVE TRIED TO, AS MR. WAPNER HAS, TO CONTEMPLATE
24	WHAT I HAVE AHEAD OF ME HERE. I HAVE FORGOTTEN HOW MANY
25	WITNESSES I NEED TO REVIEW TO DO ARGUMENT. I WOULD NOT
26	REQUIRE LESS THAN THREE WORKING DAYS TO GET BACK THROUGH
27	FIVE MONTHS OF TESTIMONY.
28	THE COURT: YOU NEED UNTIL NEXT MONDAY?
1	

Λ

1. 1. A-2 MR. BARENS: I WOULD CERTAINLY PREFER THAT, YOUR HONOR. I DO NOT THINK MR. WAPNER WOULD DISAGREE ON THAT, ALTHOUGH I HAVE NOT DISCUSSED IT WITH HIM. THE COURT: I WILL TELL YOU WHAT, IF THIS IS WHAT YOU WANT, IF YOU WANT TO CONTINUE IT UNTIL NEXT MONDAY FOR ARGUMENT TO THE JURY, I WANT IN BETWEEN THAT TIME TO GO OVER THE JURY INSTRUCTIONS WITH BOTH OF YOU SO THAT YOU WILL BE PREPARED FOR THE ARGUMENT ON MONDAY. MR. BARENS: YOUR HONOR, COULD WE DO THE INSTRUCTIONS ON THURSDAY? THE COURT: ANY TIME YOU WANT. MR. BARENS: COULD I HAVE A MOMENT WITH MR. CHIER? THE COURT: SURE. MR. BARENS: WHO WOULD HAVE SOME RESPONSIBILITY HERE. (UNREPORTED COLLOQUY BETWEEN MR. CHIER AND MR. BARENS.)

MR. BARENS: EXCUSE ME, YOUR HONOR. IF WE COULD HAVE 1 JURY INSTRUCTIONS THURSDAY AT 10:30 --2 MR. CHIER: THE LATER THE BETTER. 3 THE COURT: THURSDAY WHAT? 4 MR. BARENS: THURSDAY AT 10:30 IF WE MIGHT, YOUR HONOR. 5 THE COURT: THURSDAY WHAT? 6 MR. BARENS: AT 10:30, YOUR HONOR. 7 THE COURT: SURE. YOU WILL HAVE YOURS, TOO? 8 MR. WAPNER: YES. 9 MR. BARENS: COULD WE SPEAK FOR A MOMENT ABOUT SEQUENCING 10 IN CLOSING ARGUMENT? 11 THE COURT: SURE. 12 MR. BARENS: COULD MR. CHIER PARTICIPATE? 13 THE COURT: HE CAN TAKE THE WHOLE CONCLUDING ARGUMENT 14 IF YOU WANT TO. I WILL JUST HAVE ONE LAWYER, EITHER ONE OF 15 YOU, TAKE IT. 16 MR. BARENS: I UNDERSTAND YOUR HONOR --17 18 THE COURT: NOT TWO. MR. BARENS: YOUR HONOR, I WANT TO TRY TO UNDERSTAND 19 A QUESTION I HAVE ABOUT THE LAW, SIR, ON CLOSING ARGUMENT IN 20 21 A DEATH PENALTY CASE WHICH I BELIEVE --22 THE COURT: I TOLD YOU HOW I FELT ABOUT IT, DIDN'T I? 23 I FELT THAT MY INTERPRETATION OF THE LAW IS THAT WHEN IT TALKS ABOUT HAVING TWO COUNSEL, IT REFERS TO COUNSEL 24 25 DURING THE TRIAL, THE ENTIRE TRIAL. IT DOESN'T REFER TO THE 26 CONCLUDING ARGUMENTS BEFORE THE JURY. 27 MR. BARENS: THE ISSUE I WAS APPROACHING YOUR HONOR, 28 IS JUST HAVING MR. CHIER PARTICIPATE IN THE DISCUSSION THAT

\-1 ;

1	WE ARE HAVING AT THIS MOMENT.
2	THE COURT: WHAT DO YOU WANT TO DO? DIVIDE UP THE FINAL
3	ARGUMENT?
4	MR. BARENS: NO.
5	THE COURT: WHAT IS IT YOU WANT TO DO?
6	MR. BARENS: YOUR HONOR, I UNDERSTAND THAT THE PEOPLE
7	PROCEED AND THEN THE DEFENSE PROCEEDS AND THEN THE PEOPLE WOULD
8	CONCLUDE ?
9	THE COURT: RIGHT.
10	MR. BARENS: IF I MIGHT ASK MR. CHIER TO JOIN US? DID
11	YOU TELL ME THAT THERE WAS SOME QUESTION ABOUT THE FORMATING?
12	MR. CHIER: WHEN THERE ARE TWO ATTORNEYS ARGUING, THE
13	SECOND DEFENSE ATTORNEYS GETS THE LAST ARGUMENT. THEREFORE
14	THE COURT: I DON'T KNOW WHERE HE GETS THAT IDEA FROM?
15	DID YOU EVER HEAR OF IT?
16	MR. WAPNER: WHAT DO YOU MEAN "LAST ARGUMENT"?
17	THE COURT: HE WANTS YOU TO OPEN AND HE GOES AND THEN
18	YOU GO AND THEN HE GOES.
19	MR. WAPNER: NO.
20	MR. BARENS: ALL RIGHT. YOUR HONOR, NOT BEING CERTAIN
21	OF THAT
22	THE COURT: HAVE YOU GOT ANY AUTHORITY FOR THAT?
23	I WOULD LIKE TO SEE IT. MAYBE THERE MIGHT BE SOME QUESTION
24	WHEN THE BURDEN OF PROOF IS INVOLVED SOMETIMES ON A PENALTY
25	PHASE AND SO FORTH.
26	BUT I HAVE NEVER YET HEARD THAT IN A DEATH PENALTY
27	CASE.
28	THE PEOPLE OPEN THEIR FINAL ARGUMENT AND THEN THE

 \mathcal{O}

| _____ | _____

DEFENSE GOES AND THEN THE PEOPLE CLOSE AND THEN THE DEFENDANT 1 GOES AGAIN? WHERE DID YOU HEAR THAT FROM? WHAT AUTHORITY 2 IS THERE? 3 MR. BARENS: YOUR HONOR, I HAD NOT HEARD THAT, YOUR HONOR. 4 THAT IS WHY I WAS ASKING YOUR HONOR. 5 THE COURT: WHAT IS YOUR AUTHORITY? 6 MR. CHIER: IT IS JUST HALLWAY GOSSIP, SIR. 7 MR. BARENS: SOME LAWYERS WERE DISCUSSING IT, YOUR HONOR. 8 SOME LAWYERS WERE DISCUSSING IT. HAVE YOU HEARD OF IT? 9 THE COURT: WELL, I HAVE ONLY BEEN ON THE BENCH ABOUT 10 26 YEARS. I HAVE NEVER HEARD OF IT, EVER. 11 MR. BARENS: THAT IS WHY I AM ASKING. 12 MR. CHIER: I WILL TRY TO GET AUTHORITY. 13 THE COURT: OUT IN THE HALLWAY OR IN THE COURTROOM? 14 MR. BARENS: I ASKED THE COURT BECAUSE I DIDN'T KNOW 15 MYSELF, YOUR HONOR. I WOULD RELY ON YOUR HONOR'S EXPERIENCE. 16 THE COURT: ARE YOU ASKING THAT YOU GO AND THEN THE 17 PEOPLE GO AND THEN YOU GO AND THEN THE PEOPLE GO AGAIN? 18 YOU WANT TO HAVE FINAL ARGUMENT HEARD AND HAVE IT DONE BY 19 20 MR. CHIER? 21 MR. BARENS: NOT IF THAT IS YOUR HONOR'S PROPOSAL. IF I SAY YES TO THAT, WHAT YOU ARE SAYING, I CAN'T ARGUE, AS WELL. 22 I BELIEVED THAT THE CODE CLEARLY SAID THAT TWO 23 24 COUNSEL COULD PARTICIPATE IN CLOSING ARGUMENT. I STILL BELIEVE 25 THAT. THE COURT: YOU STILL BELIEVE THAT? WELL, YOU AND I 26 27 DIFFER ABOUT IT. 28 MR. BARENS: YOUR HONOR HAS RULED?

4-3

1	THE COURT: YES.
2	MR. BARENS: I PROPOSE TO MAKE CLOSING ARGUMENT.
3	THE COURT: AND THAT IS NOT IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE WAY
4	HE WAS ENGAGED AND IS BEING PAID BY THE COURT, FOR BEING
5	ASSOCIATE COUNSEL WITH YOU.
6	MR. BARENS: SIR, ANY ARRANGEMENT WE MADE COULD NOT
7	NULLIFY THAT SECTION, IN MY OPINION.
8	THE COURT: WELL, OF COURSE NOT. BUT I DON'T INTERPRET
9.	IT THE WAY YOU THINK IT SHOULD BE INTERPRETED.
10	MR. BARENS: I UNDERSTAND THAT.
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

^ - 4

THE COURT: YOU CAN DO YOUR COMPLETE ARGUMENT. HE GOES 1 AHEAD AND THEN HE MAKES A COMPLETE ARGUMENT? IS THAT IT? 2 MR. BARENS: I WOULD IMAGINE YOUR HONOR, SINCE THE COURT 3 DOESN'T SPECIFICALLY ADDRESS THAT ISSUE, THAT EACH -- SINCE 4 THERE IS NO LIMITATION, THAT EACH COUNSEL COULD MAKE A 5 COMPLETE ARGUMENT, INCLUDING --6 THE COURT: THAT MEANS THE PEOPLE GO FIRST AND THEN YOU 7 GO AND THEN MR. CHIER GOES AND THEN THE PEOPLE GO? 8 MR. BARENS: YES, YOUR HONOR. 9 THE COURT: THEN THE PEOPLE CONCLUDE ARGUMENT? 10 MR. BARENS: YES, YOUR HONOR. 11 THE COURT: I DON'T INTERPRET IT THAT WAY. 12 MR. WAPNER: EVEN IF THE SECTION IS READ TO PERMIT TWO 13 COUNSEL TO ARGUE, THAT CERTAINLY DOESN'T ABROGATE A JUDGE'S 14 RESPONSIBILITY TO CONTROL THE COURTROOM AND SET GUIDELINES 15 OF WHAT CAN BE ARGUED AND WHAT CAN'T. 16 SO THE COURT CAN DELINEATE SO THAT THERE ARE 17 PORTIONS OF THE CASE THAT CAN BE ARGUED BY ONE AND THE OTHER. 18 19 BUT TO PERMIT TWO COMPLETE, SEPARATE ARGUMENTS, I DON'T THINK THAT THAT IS NECESSARILY WHAT THE CODE 20 21 CONTEMPLATES. MR. BARENS: I DID NOT MEAN TO SUGGEST THAT MR. CHIER 22 WOULD BE PERMITTED TO ARGUE AND THEN WE WOULD BOTH ARGUE THE 23 SAME PORTIONS OF THE CASE. 24 25 THE COURT: THERE IS NO WAY OF CONTROLLING THAT. 26 MR. BARENS: YOUR HONOR, I DID WANT TO -- IF I AM 27 UNDERSTANDING YOUR HONOR CORRECTLY, IF THERE WERE A TIME ALLOTMENT GIVEN TO THE PEOPLE AND THE DEFENDANT THAT WAS 28

4-5

ROUGHLY EQUIVALENT WHICH I ANTICIPATE IT WILL BE, THAT IF WE 1 WERE TO DIVIDE THE TIME WHERE I SAID I WOULD ARGUE TWO-THIRDS 2 OF THE TIME AND MR. CHIER WOULD ARGUE ONE-THIRD OF THE TIME, 3 YOUR HONOR WOULD NOT FIND THAT ACCEPTABLE? 4 5 THE COURT: NO. I WILL NOT PERMIT YOU TO HAVE TWO ARGUMENTS. 6 MR. BARENS: LET US ADDRESS THE ISSUE OF TIME. AGAIN, 7 I DON'T KNOW WHAT MR. WAPNER -- I HAVE NOT DISCUSSED IT. 8 MR. CHIER: LET'S DO IT TOMORROW. 9 10 MR. BARENS: MAYBE WE COULD DISCUSS IT WITH MR. WAPNER 11 AND WE COULD COME TO SOME --THE COURT: VERY GOOD. YOU CAN DO THAT. 12 13 MR. CHIER: THERE ARE TWO MATTERS PENDING. 14 MR. BARENS: THERE ARE TWO MATTERS STILL BEFORE THE 15 COURT, HOWEVER. 16 THE COURT: BOTH SIDES HAVE NOT RESTED YET, HAVE THEY? 17 MR. BARENS: WELL, MR. --18 THE COURT: THE PEOPLE HAVE NOT RESTED? 19 MR. BARENS: NO. MR. WAPNER SAID HE WAS GOING TO DO 20 SOME REBUTTAL. 21 THE COURT: WHAT IS IT THAT YOU ANTICIPATE? 22 MR. BARENS: WELL, WE HAVE TWO MOTIONS STILL PENDING 23 BEFORE THE COURT. 24 THE COURT: WHAT ARE THEY? 25 MR. BARENS: ONE WAS A MOTION IN LIMINE FOR AN 26 INSTRUCTION THAT WE WERE SEEKING RELATIVE TO THAT ISSUE ABOUT 27 MR. ESLAMINIA'S FATHER THAT CAME UP. 28 MR. CHIER: 2.50.

MR. BARENS: FOR SOME REASON, THAT 2.50 ISSUE WAS 1 DISCUSSED BOTH AT THE BENCH AND IN CHAMBERS. 2 THE COURT: I DON'T KNOW WHAT YOU MEAN. THE TESTIMONY 3 IS ALREADY IN. WHAT DO YOU WANT TO DO? WHY DON'T YOU 4 SUBMIT THE PROPOSED INSTRUCTION AND I WILL --5 MR. CHIER: THERE IS NONE. 6 MR. BARENS: WELL, THE PROBLEM IS, I DON'T KNOW WHAT 7 TO SUBMIT. 8 THE COURT: SUBMIT WHATEVER YOU THINK SHOULD BE SUBMITTED. 9 BARENS: ALL RIGHT. A MOMENT. 10 MR. (UNREPORTED COLLOQUY BETWEEN COUNSEL.) 11 MR. BARENS: YOUR HONOR, I WISH TO REMIND YOUR HONOR 12 THAT YOUR HONOR ADVISED COUNSEL WHEN WE HAD A COLLOQUY 13 CONCERNING THAT NEWSPAPER REFERENCE THAT YOUR HONOR DID NOT 14 MAKE -- BUT THAT YOUR HONOR HAD READ FROM BUT DID NOT TELL 15 THE JURY YOU WERE READING FROM, WHEN MRS. LYNNE ROBERTS WAS 16 ON THE STAND, YOUR HONOR SAID THAT YOU WOULD TAKE CARE OF THAT 17 18 SOMEHOW. YOU SAID THAT YOU WOULD CONSIDER THAT AND TAKE 19 CARE OF IT SOMEHOW APPROPRIATELY, SIR. 20 21 THE COURT: WELL, I DON'T KNOW. WHAT IS IT THAT YOU 22 WANT TO DO? MR. CHIER: WELL, I WANT YOUR HONOR TO MAKE A STATEMENT 23 24 TO THE JURY THAT YOUR HONOR HAD NOT READ AN ARTICLE THAT SAID 25 THAT BOBBY ROBERTS WAS RECEIVING CONSIDERATION IN THIS CASE. 26 27 28

F

THE COURT: I THOUGHT WE HAD READ THE RECORD AND THE
RECORD DIDN'T INDICATE THERE WAS ANYTHING AT ALL TO DO WITH
THE NEWSPAPER ARTICLE.

4

13

- 1

MR. WAPNER: THAT IS CORRECT.

5 MR. BARENS: WHAT THE DEFENSE WAS CONCERNED ABOUT, 6 YOUR HONOR, WAS WHAT APPEARED TO ME TO BE THE OBVIOUS 7 OPPORTUNITY THE JURY HAD TO LOOK OVER HERE TO SEE THAT AS 8 YOUR HONOR TURNED TO SPEAK TO US, YOUR HONOR PICKED UP A 9 PIECE OF PAPER THAT LOOKED LIKE A NEWSPAPER ARTICLE AND IT 10 WAS OBVIOUS TO THE JURY, I SUBMIT MOST RESPECTFULLY, YOUR 11 HONOR, THAT YOUR HONOR HAD MADE REFERENCE TO SOMETHING IN 12 ASKING THE QUESTIONS.

MR. WAPNER: WELL, NUMBER 1, I DIDN'T SEE THAT.

14 BUT NUMBER 2, ASSUMING THAT THE JURY SHOULD SEE 15 THAT THE JUDGE HAD A PIECE OF PAPER IN HIS HAND, IT WASN'T 16 ANY DIFFERENT THAN ANYTHING HE HAS DONE MANY TIMES DURING 17 THE COURSE OF THIS TRIAL AND TO ASSUME THAT IT WAS A NEWSPAPER 18 ARTICLE, WHEN THERE IS NOTHING ABOUT THAT IN THE TESTIMONY, 19 AND THEN TO HAVE THE JUDGE SAY THAT "I DIDN'T READ AN ARTICLE," 20 IS PUTTING SOMETHING INTO THE MINDS OF THE JURY THAT ISN'T 21 THERE IN THE FIRST PLACE AND THE CURE IS WORSE THAN THE 22 SOLUTION.

THE COURT: YOU MEAN THE CURE IS WORSE THAN THE DISEASE.
 MR. WAPNER: RIGHT.

25 MR. BARENS: I MEAN I OBVIOUSLY HAVE CONCERNS ABOUT
26 THIS OR I WOULDN'T BE AT THE BENCH ON THIS.

27 I FEEL THERE WAS NO QUESTION IN MY MIND, JUDGE,
28 THAT I PERCEIVED FROM WHERE I WAS STANDING IN THE COURTROOM

1 THAT YOUR HONOR WAS -- I MEAN FROM WHERE I WAS SEATED IN THE COURTROOM, I PERCEIVED YOU WERE READING FROM A NEWSPAPER 2 3 ARTICLE BECAUSE THE FIRST THING I DID WAS TO TURN TO MR. 4 CHIER AND ASK HIM, "IS THAT FROM SOME NEWSPAPER HE IS 5 READING?" AND I THOUGHT YOU WERE READING FROM A NEWSPAPER.

6 THE COURT: THE ONLY TIME I MADE REFERENCE TO A 7 NEWSPAPER WAS AT THE TIME THE CLERK HAD PICKED UP AN ARTICLE 8 ABOUT THE CASE FROM THE DAILY NEWS AND WHEN WE TALKED ABOUT 9 THE JUROR AND SHE HAVING READ ARTICLES.

I AM GOING TO LEAVE IT THE WAY IT IS. 11 MR. BARENS: ALL RIGHT, YOUR HONOR. THE ONLY CONTINUING CONCERN I HAVE IS THAT THE THING TROUBLING ME MOST ON THAT, 12 13 JUDGE, WAS IT WAS OBVIOUS TO THE JURY AND EVERYONE IN THE 14 COURTROOM THAT YOU WERE READING FROM SOMETHING. YOU WEREN'T 15 DOING IT FROM MEMORY, JUDGE. IT DIDN'T SEEM LIKE YOU WERE 16 JUST TAKING THE NAMES AND THOSE REFERENCES OUT OF THIN AIR 17 AND WHEN YOU TURNED TO ADDRESS COUNSEL AND PICKED UP THE 18 PIECE OF PAPER TO SHOW IT TO ME, I SUBMIT THAT THE JURY MOST 19 PROBABLY SAW IT.

THE COURT: WHAT OF IT?

- 2

10

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Δ

1	MR. BARENS: IT WOULD MEAN THAT YOUR HONOR WAS READING
2	FROM A NEWSPAPER ARTICLE THAT IMPLIED, AT LEAST TO YOUR HONOR
3	THAT CONSIDERATION WAS PAID TO BOBBY ROBERTS.
4	THE COURT: THERE WAS WHAT?
5	MR. BARENS: THERE WAS CONSIDERATION PAID TO BOBBY
6	ROBERTS, BECAUSE THAT WAS THE THRUST OF YOUR QUESTIONING,
7	SIR.
8	MR. WAPNER: I HAVE NO OBJECTION
9	THE COURT: I POINTED OUT THE OTHER DAY THAT YOU YOUR-
10	SELF, I DON'T KNOW WHY YOU DID IT, BUT YOU YOURSELF HAVE
11	SAID "ARE YOU PROFITING FROM THIS PARTICULAR MATTER IN ANY
12	WAY?"
13	MR. BARENS: YES, YOUR HONOR.
14	THE COURT: THEN HAVING OPENED THE DOOR THAT WAY, THERE
15	WAS AN ARTICLE WHICH INDICATED THAT ROBERTS WAS SOMEHOW
16	INVOLVED WITH THESE THEATRICAL AGENTS WHO WERE REPRESENTING
17	HIM AND TALKING ABOUT MILLIONS OF DOLLARS OR MORE FOR RIGHTS
18	OF THE BOOK. ALL I ASKED ABOUT WAS WHETHER OR NOT THEY
19	WERE PROFITING IN ANY WAY, NOT WHETHER OR NOT THEY KNEW
20	ANYTHING ABOUT THAT OR WHETHER THEY PARTICIPATED IN ANY RIGHTS
21	THAT THE THEATRICAL AGENTS WERE GETTING, IF ANYTHING, FROM
22	THE BOOK. AND SHE SAID "NO, IT COSTS US MONEY."
23	WHY DON'T YOU LET IT LIE THAT WAY?
24	MR. BARENS: I JUST, AGAIN, BEING AS PROPHYLACTIC AS
25	I CAN BE HERE, YOUR HONOR, THE IMPLICATION TO THE JURY REMAINS
26	THAT YOUR HONOR WAS READING FROM THE NEWSPAPER ARTICLE THAT
27	CONTRADICTED THE WITNESS.
28	THE COURT: IT WASN'T LIKE THE BIBLE THAT IS SACROSANCT

. 1A

j.

A-2 . 1 AND EVERYTHING IN THE BIBLE IS TRUE, ASSUMING THERE IS SOME-2 THING IN THE NEWSPAPER. 3 MR. BARENS: I THINK IF THEY INTERPRET YOUR HONOR 4 SIGNIFYING WHAT YOUR HONOR WAS READING, ENOUGH TO ASK THE 5 WITNESS A QUESTION ABOUT IT, OBVIOUSLY IT HAD AN IMPACT ON 6 YOUR HONOR OR YOUR HONOR WOULD NOT HAVE INQUIRED. 7 THE COURT: I WILL LET IT STAND THE WAY IT IS. I AM 8 NOT GOING TO DO ANYTHING FURTHER ABOUT IT. 9 MR. BARENS: YOU HAVE MARKED IT AS A COURT EXHIBIT? 10 THE COURT: DID I? I THINK I DID, DIDN'T I? 11 THE CLERK: YES. 12 THE COURT: YES, IT IS A COURT EXHIBIT. 13 MR. BARENS: ALL RIGHT, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. 14 THE COURT: NOW YOU HAVE GOT A RECORD MADE FOR IT. 15 MR. BARENS: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR. 16 DID YOU HAVE A COMMENT? 17 MR. WAPNER: NO. I HAVE NO OBJECTION IF THE COURT WANTS 18 TO GIVE SOME INSTRUCTION ABOUT THE IDEA, WHAT I WAS SAYING 19 BEFORE, I DON'T WANT IT TO BE CONSTRUED IN ANY OTHER WAY, 20 OTHER THAN THE FACT THAT TO MAKE MENTION OF AN ARTICLE THAT 21 WAS NOT ACTUALLY MENTIONED. 22 THE COURT: TELL ME WHAT KIND OF INSTRUCTION WOULD 23 I BE ABLE TO GIVE? 24 MR. WAPNER: I HAVE NO IDEA. 25 MR. BARENS: WELL, YOU KNOW, SOMETIMES WE CAN TALK 26 IN JUST PLAIN LANGUAGE TO PEOPLE WHERE WE JUST SAY, "I DID 27 NOT MEAN TO IMPLY TO YOU THAT I READ ANYTHING IN THE NEWS-28 PAPERS."

1	THE COURT: I WILL THINK ABOUT IT.
2	MR. WAPNER: THE COURT GIVES A GENERAL INSTRUCTION
3	TO THAT EFFECT AT THE END OF THE CASE.
4	MR. BARENS: WHAT INSTRUCTION IS THAT?
5	THE COURT: THE INSTRUCTION IS THAT THEY ARE NOT TO
6	CONSIDER ANYTHING EXCEPT WHAT IS IN EVIDENCE AND NOT SPECULATE.
7	MR. BARENS: YOU HAVE TO TELL THEM YOU WON'T EITHER.
8	MR. WAPNER: THE COURT GIVES AN INSTRUCTION THAT "NOTHING
9	I HAVE SAID OR DONE IS MEANT TO IMPLY THAT I BELIEVE OR
10	DISBELIEVE ANY WITNESS."
11	THE COURT: I AM GOING TO GO FURTHER THAN THAT. ALL
12	OF THESE DIFFERENCES WHICH HAVE ARISEN AMOUNG COUNSEL, BETWEEN
13	COUNSEL AND THE COURT, I INTEND TO TELL THE JURY THAT THEY
14	ARE COMPLETELY TO DISREGARD ANYTHING, ANY IMPRESSION THEY
15	MIGHT HAVE.
16	MR. BARENS: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR. I APPRECIATE THAT.
17	THE COURT: THAT IS WHAT I AM GOING TO DO IN NO
18	UNCERTAIN TERMS.
19	MR. BARENS: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.
20	THE COURT: TO BE SURE THERE IS NO ERROR.
21	MR. BARENS: THANK YOU, YOUR HONOR.
22	(AT 2:15 P.M. AN ADJOURNMENT WAS TAKEN,
23	TO RESUME AT 10:30 A.M., TUESDAY, APRIL
24	7, 1987.)
25	
26	
27	
28	

1A-3